



## COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA

## DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

\* \* \* \* \*

IN RE: PROPOSED RULEMAKING: CO2 BUDGET TRADING  
PROGRAM

\* \* \* \* \*

BEFORE: JESSICA SHIRLEY, Chair  
SARAH PINTER, Member  
DAREK JAGIELA, Member  
LAURA GRIFFIN, Member  
JENNIFER SWAN, Member

HEARING: Wednesday, December 9, 2020  
6:00 p.m.

LOCATION: WEBEX VIDEO CONFERENCE

WITNESSES: None

Reporter: Kelly Gallick

Any reproduction of this transcript  
is prohibited without authorization  
by the certifying agency

A P P E A R A N C E S

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

NONE

## I N D E X

1		
2		
3	OPENING REMARKS	
4	By Chair	8 - 13
5	TESTIMONY	
6	By Ms. McCool	13 - 16
7	TESTIMONY	
8	By Mr. Weinstein	17 - 20
9	TESTIMONY	
10	By Representative Shusterman	20 - 24
11	TESTIMONY	
12	By Ms. Jacko	24 - 27
13	TESTIMONY	
14	By Ms. Mitchell	27 - 29
15	TESTIMONY	
16	By Ms. Rupert	29 - 32
17	TESTIMONY	
18	By Ms. St-Cyr	32 - 33
19	TESTIMONY	
20	By Ms. Martik	34 - 37
21	TESTIMONY	
22	By Mr. Dugan	37 - 40
23	TESTIMONY	
24	By Mr. Hood	40 - 41
25		

1	I N D E X (cont.)	
2		
3	TESTIMONY	
4	By Mr. Everbach	41 - 45
5	TESTIMONY	
6	By Mr. Fichman	45 - 49
7	TESTIMONY	
8	By Ms. Bentley	49 - 53
9	TESTIMONY	
10	By Ms. Clough	53 - 57
11	TESTIMONY	
12	By Ms. Brunton	57 - 61
13	TESTIMONY	
14	By Mr. Schuster	61 - 64
15	TESTIMONY	
16	By Ms. Noonan	65 - 68
17	TESTIMONY	
18	By Ms. Fetting	68 - 72
19	TESTIMONY	
20	By Mr. Coffey	72 - 74
21	TESTIMONY	
22	By Ms. Berry	74 - 76
23	TESTIMONY	
24	By Ms. Arya	77 - 79
25		

## I N D E X (cont.)

1		
2		
3	TESTIMONY	
4	By Ms. Smith-Brubaker	79 - 83
5	TESTIMONY	
6	By Ms. Salerno	83 - 87
7	TESTIMONY	
8	By Ms. Mulligan	87 - 91
9	TESTIMONY	
10	By Ms. Rapone	92 - 95
11	TESTIMONY	
12	By Mr. Horwitz	95 - 98
13	TESTIMONY	
14	By Ms. Leiter	98 - 102
15	TESTIMONY	
16	By Ms. Schapira	102 - 107
17	TESTIMONY	
18	By Mr. Mehalik	107 - 111
19	TESTIMONY	
20	By Mr. Karaica	111 - 114
21	TESTIMONY	
22	By Mr. Little	114 - 116
23	TESTIMONY	
24	By Ms. Mather	116 - 120
25		

I N D E X (cont.)

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

TESTIMONY	
By Ms. Prytherch	120 - 122
TESTIMONY	
By Ms. Gallo	122 - 126
TESTIMONY	
By Mr. Warren	126 - 127
TESTIMONY	
By Ms. Munn	128 - 131
DISCUSSION AMONG PARTIES	131 - 132

E X H I B I T S

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

<u>Number</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Page</u> <u>Offered</u>	<u>Page</u> <u>Admitted</u>
---------------	--------------------	-------------------------------	--------------------------------

NONE OFFERED

## P R O C E E D I N G S

-----

CHAIR: Well, I just started talking and I didn't un-mute. So hopefully that's the only time I do that. I'm so sorry. Good evening. I would like to welcome you to the environmental quality board or EQB, public hearing on a proposed rulemaking for the Pennsylvania CO2 budget trading program.

My name is Jessica Shirley. And I am the policy director for the Department of Environmental Protection. I am facilitating this hearing on behalf of the Environmental Quality Board. Assisting me today is Darek Jagiela, our host, Sarah Pinter, an executive policy specialist, Laura Griffin, a regulatory coordinator, and Jennifer Swan, who most of you corresponded with to register for this hearing.

I officially call this hearing to order at 6:01 p.m. This public hearing will be recorded in its entirety. Additionally, a stenographer will be transcribing the hearing.

The purpose of this hearing is to formally accept testimony on the proposed rulemaking. The proposed rulemaking was adopted by



1 the EQB at its meeting on September 15th, 2020.

2 It proposes to establish a program to  
3 limit carbon dioxide or CO2 emissions from fossil  
4 fuel fired power plants located in Pennsylvania with  
5 an electricity generation capacity equal to or  
6 greater than 25 megawatts. The purpose of this  
7 proposed rulemaking is to reduce CO2 emissions,  
8 which is a greenhouse gas and major contributor to  
9 climate change impacts in a manner that protects  
10 public health, welfare and the environment.

11 Under the authority of Pennsylvania's  
12 Air Pollution Control Act, the proposed rulemaking  
13 would establish Pennsylvania's participation in the  
14 Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative or RGGI, a  
15 regional CO2 budget trading program. In addition to  
16 reducing emissions, Pennsylvania will also see a  
17 decrease in harmful NOX, SO2 and particulate matter  
18 emissions as well as ground level ozone pollution.

19 Human exposure to these air pollutants  
20 contributes to respiratory and cardiovascular health  
21 problems, including asthma, bronchitis, heart  
22 attacks and strokes. By participating in RGGI, the  
23 DEP estimates that Pennsylvania will see CO2  
24 emission reductions of around 188 million tons by  
25 2030. This concludes the summary of the rulemaking.

1           If you would like to access a more  
2 detailed explanation of regulatory amendments  
3 included in the rulemaking, you can visit ECOMMENT  
4 on DEP's webpage and select regulations.

5           In order to give everyone an equal  
6 opportunity to comment on this proposal, I would  
7 like to establish the following rules. Sarah is  
8 going to provide some of this information in the Q&A  
9 or chat box, so you don't need to write everything  
10 down. I will call upon the witnesses who have  
11 signed up to testify at this hearing. All who  
12 signed up were assigned a number, indicating the  
13 order in which witnesses will be called to speak.

14           Only those who signed up by contacting  
15 Jennifer Swan as indicated on the EQB webpage will  
16 be called upon to provide testimony. When you are  
17 called, your line will be un-muted. Testimony is  
18 limited to five minutes for each witness. And I  
19 will have a timer on the screen. Please note that  
20 written and spoken testimony both carry the same  
21 weight. If you should run out of time for your  
22 spoken testimony, we will read the rest of your  
23 comments from your written testimony.

24           As advised in registration  
25 correspondence, please provide a copy of your

1 written testimony to regs comments at PA.gov. Your  
2 email must note that you are submitting testimony  
3 for proposed rulemaking, CO2 budget trading program,  
4 along with the following information, your first and  
5 last name, your mailing address, your email address  
6 and if you are commenting on behalf of an  
7 organization.

8                   Testimony is not required to be five  
9 minutes long. If others who provide testimony  
10 before you are making similar statements to yours,  
11 you are free to shorten or summarize your verbal  
12 testimony at that time and still provide your full  
13 testimony by email. This will allow us to hear from  
14 more commenters at this hearing.

15                   Through the sign-up process,  
16 perspective commenters were asked to designate one  
17 witness to present testimony on behalf of an  
18 organization. Please state your name, address, the  
19 city and state are sufficient, and affiliation, if  
20 you have one, for the record prior to presenting  
21 your testimony. The EQB would appreciate your help  
22 by spelling out your name and terms that may not be  
23 generally familiar, so that the transcript can be as  
24 accurate as possible.

25                   Because the purpose of this hearing is

1 to receive comments on the proposal, EQB members or  
2 DEP staff cannot address questions about the  
3 proposed rulemaking during the duration of the  
4 hearing. In addition to or in place of verbal  
5 testimony presented at today's hearing, interested  
6 persons may also submit written comments on this  
7 proposal. Again, written and verbal comments hold  
8 the same weight when considered in the finalization  
9 of this proposed rulemaking.

10 All testimony and written comments  
11 provided become a part of the official public  
12 record. All comments must be received by the EQB on  
13 or before January 14th, 2021. There are a few  
14 different ways to submit written comments separately  
15 from the testimony. Comments may be submitted  
16 online through ECOMMENT, accessible from DEP's  
17 website. Click the ECOMMENT icon near the top of  
18 DEP's homepage, [www.DEP.PA.gov](http://www.DEP.PA.gov). Or comments may be  
19 submitted by email at [reg/comments at PA.gov](mailto:reg/comments@PA.gov). All  
20 comments are entered into ECOMMENT and are  
21 accessible to the public.

22 A subject heading of the proposed  
23 rulemaking and a return name and address must be  
24 included in each email. Comments may also be sent  
25 through the U.S. Postal Mail, addressed to the

1 Environmental Quality Board, P.O. Box 8477,  
2 Harrisburg, PA, 17105-8477. All testimony received  
3 at this hearing as well as written comments received  
4 by January 14th, 2021 will be considered by the EQB,  
5 and will be included in a comment and response  
6 document, which will be prepared by DEP and reviewed  
7 by the EQB, prior to the Board taking its final  
8 action on this regulation. All right.

9 Now, I will share my screen and call  
10 the first testifier. Okay. First - first up we  
11 have number one, Elisa McCool.

12 MS. MCCOOL: Good evening. My name is  
13 Elisa McCool. It's spelled E-L-I-S-A. Last name,  
14 M-C-C-O-O-L. And I'm a resident of Philadelphia,  
15 PA.

16 I appreciate the opportunity to offer  
17 testimony at this public hearing. I have been  
18 concerned about climate change for a long time. But  
19 about eight years ago I started to read more about  
20 climate change. And the more I learned, the more  
21 alarmed I became.

22 I once saw climate change as a tough  
23 problem that needed to be addressed and could be  
24 addressed, but the more I read about what climate  
25 scientists were really saying about the scope and

1 speed of a climate emergency, the more I felt myself  
2 sinking into despair about our collective future. I  
3 became one of the growing number of people who  
4 seriously questioned the idea of whether or not to  
5 have children, given the threats of climate disaster  
6 and the large carbon footprint of each person who  
7 lives in the U.S.

8 I hated feeling this despair. And  
9 yet, I think that I needed to start fully facing up  
10 to the scale of the emergency, in order to gain the  
11 strength I needed to really get in this fight  
12 against climate change. Although the path towards  
13 mitigating the worst effects of climate change is  
14 filled with obstacles, I began to see that those of  
15 us living now, and particularly those of us with  
16 power to influence policies and regulations have a  
17 moral responsibility to take action.

18 Joining RGGI is one necessary step  
19 that Pennsylvania can take to move our region  
20 towards a better future. But in order to make sure  
21 that RGGI actually creates a more just and livable  
22 future, it will have to be implemented carefully  
23 with an explicit focus on using the rules to repair  
24 past harms and increase equity.

25 In addition to growing more alarmed

1 the more I read about climate change, I also began  
2 to learn more about environmental racism and the  
3 unequal impacts of climate change. As a white  
4 person, I believe it is the responsibility of myself  
5 and other white people to take action to eliminate  
6 structural racism and to work towards repairing its  
7 past and current harms.

8                   Also, as a Jew, I feel that I have a  
9 moral obligation to pursue racial and economic  
10 justice, alongside stewardship of the earth. Taking  
11 a stand for environmental justice is essential.  
12 RGGI is important, but we must implement RGGI in  
13 such a way that it creates a more equitable future  
14 for all Pennsylvanians. We cannot allow it to be  
15 implemented in such a way that it leads to further  
16 racial injustice.

17                   Therefore, I am asking the  
18 environmental quality board to do the following  
19 things. First, the rules for RGGI should be written  
20 to ensure that communities that have been  
21 disproportionately harmed by pollution in our state,  
22 which are frequently communities of color, will gain  
23 environmental health and economic benefits from  
24 RGGI. In addition, the residents of these  
25 communities must play a central role in determining

1 how their communities should benefit.

2                   Secondly, we cannot allow hot spots of  
3 pollution to be created or intensified as a result  
4 of the way of emission allowances are distributed.  
5 As our statewide emissions decrease, we must make  
6 sure that emissions do not increase in certain  
7 communities that have already been  
8 disproportionately impacted.

9                   And lastly, the funds generated from  
10 RGGI should go into the clean air fund, not the  
11 general fund. And more specifically, they should be  
12 used for projects that will benefit environment  
13 justice communities. Such projects could include  
14 providing utility credits if costs for utilities  
15 rise under RGGI, creating more solar power  
16 infrastructure, funding for home weatherization and  
17 energy efficiency, lead removal and remediation of  
18 toxic sites and the creation of more green space and  
19 green storm water management.

20                   Pennsylvania needs a more equitable,  
21 livable future for all. Please craft rules for RGGI  
22 that will further these aims. Thank you for your  
23 time.

24                   CHAIR: Thank you.

25                   Okay. Next up, I'm being told that



1 Richard Fernandez is not on the WebEx. So Richard,  
2 if you are on, please let us know in the chat.  
3 Otherwise, we are going to move on to number three.

4 Akiva Weinstein. Do we have Akiva  
5 with us?

6 MR. WEINSTEIN: Yes, I'm here.

7 CHAIR: Hi. Begin.

8 MR. WEINSTEIN: Good evening. My name  
9 is Akiva Weinstein, that's spelled A-K-I-V-A. And I  
10 am a resident of Philadelphia, Pennsylvania. Thank  
11 you for the opportunity to speak at this virtual  
12 public hearing. Climate change is one of the  
13 greatest, if not the greatest, threat that humanity  
14 currently faces. Here in Pennsylvania, we are  
15 already experiencing the effects. Climate change  
16 causes strong storms that increase flooding, which  
17 drain our infrastructure and our budgets.

18 2018 alone, PennDOT spent more than  
19 \$125 million to repair flooding and landslide  
20 damage. 2019, power outages hit a record high,  
21 disrupting electricity for nearly two million PA  
22 customers. By 2050, temperatures in Pennsylvania  
23 are projected to increase by 5.4 degrees. The  
24 number of days with a heat index of 90 degrees will  
25 increase dramatically from 8 to 40 per year. This

1 will have a huge impact on our farmers, especially  
2 dairy farmers.

3                   Climate change contributes to an  
4 increase in Lyme disease, West Nile virus and other  
5 tick and mosquito borne illnesses. Heat related  
6 deaths are also on the rise. Along with an increase  
7 in respiratory illness like asthma, which  
8 disproportionately affect our children, our elderly  
9 and inhabitants of low income and marginalized  
10 communities.

11                   Unfortunately, as the third largest  
12 producer of carbon pollution in the country,  
13 Pennsylvania is contributing to climate change, and  
14 by extension, these disastrous effects to our  
15 communities and our environment. It's time for  
16 Pennsylvania to get on board with a proven program  
17 to reduce carbon polluted - carbon pollution and  
18 create thousands of jobs by joining the bipartisan  
19 Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative or RGGI.

20                   RGGI has been a massive - massive  
21 success in the states in which it's in place,  
22 cutting climate pollution by a third and raising  
23 nearly \$3 billion to invest in clean energy and  
24 other purposes. Additionally, by joining this  
25 program, Pennsylvania will receive hundreds of

1 millions of dollars in proceeds. These funds will  
2 be invested in targeted efforts to eliminate air  
3 pollution and support job creation to support  
4 working Pennsylvanians and help boost the state's  
5 long-term economic recovery from COVID-19.

6 A portion of these proceeds could be  
7 used to help workers and communities who will be  
8 affected by the ongoing and inevitable transition of  
9 the energy market away from the coal to natural gas  
10 and renewables. Expert analysis conducted for DEP  
11 confirmed that RGGI would produce a net increase of  
12 27,000 jobs and add \$1.9 billion to our state's  
13 economy.

14 Participation in RGGI would also make  
15 our citizens healthier. DEP analysis concluded that  
16 overall carbon emissions will be cut by more than  
17 180,000,000 tons from 2022 to 2030. Harmful sulfur  
18 dioxide and nitrogen oxide emissions will be cut as  
19 well. That will produce \$6.3 billion in healthcare  
20 savings and 30,000 fewer hospital visits for  
21 respiratory illnesses like asthma among children and  
22 adults. There will also be 45,000 fewer asthma  
23 attacks and 1,000 fewer cases of childhood  
24 bronchitis.

25 Pennsylvanians want their lawmakers to

1 address climate change. Polling shows that three in  
2 four Pennsylvanians support reducing carbon  
3 pollution from power plants and want their  
4 electricity to come from clean energy sources that  
5 do not create carbon pollution.

6 Business large - businesses large and  
7 small are also on board and support RGGI's market  
8 based approach. Additionally, as a middle school  
9 science teacher who has worked in two charter  
10 schools in Philadelphia, I have seen firsthand how  
11 the youth of the city are passionate about climate  
12 change. I have seen students complete advocacy  
13 programs to address climate change because they want  
14 a brighter, cleaner and healthier future.

15 We must not let down the future  
16 generations. Thank you for considering my  
17 testimony.

18 CHAIR: Thank you.

19 Next up we have number four,  
20 Representative Melissa Shusterman. Do we have  
21 Representative Shusterman on the line?

22 REPRESENTATIVE SHUSTERMAN: Yes.

23 Thank you very much. My name - hello.  
24 I'm Representative Melissa Shusterman, spelled M-E-  
25 L-I-S-S-A, S-H-U-S-T-E-R-M-A-N. I represent

1 Pennsylvania's 157th Legislative District that makes  
2 up Tredyffrin Township, Schuylkill Township and the  
3 Borough of Phoenixville in Chester County and part  
4 of Upper Providence Township in Montgomery County.

5 Working on Pennsylvania's approach to  
6 climate change has been one of my biggest priorities  
7 since being elected in 2018. I firmly believe that  
8 Pennsylvania needs to join RGGI. This is a critical  
9 cap-and-invest program that creates economic  
10 incentives for reducing carbon emissions. The  
11 science on climate change on the effects of harmful  
12 emissions is settled. It is time for Pennsylvania  
13 to join our neighbors and start tackling and taking  
14 action steps to limit our carbon emissions.

15 First - firstly, joining RGGI will be  
16 a big step towards combating climate change.  
17 Pennsylvania is currently the fourth highest  
18 greenhouse gas producer in the country. As  
19 Pennsylvanians, we have a responsibility to reduce  
20 our carbon footprint. Joining RGGI would allow PA  
21 to make a substantial step in that direction. And  
22 we know this, because we have been able to observe  
23 these positive impacts in our neighboring states.

24 In the ten-year period from 2008 to  
25 2018, states that are RGGI members have cut their

1 carbon production in half. Joining RGGI is  
2 projected to reduce our Commonwealth's carbon  
3 emission by 188 million tons by 2030. This would  
4 have major environmental impact. Pennsylvania should  
5 be a leader in going green, not standing by while we  
6 watch our neighbors take charge.

7           Secondly, we must acknowledge that  
8 climate change is a public health crisis. Joining  
9 RGGI will lead to a decrease in pollution that has a  
10 direct negative impact on our health. Our seniors,  
11 children and economically poor residents are  
12 disproportionately harmed by pollution.

13           Asthma risks can be greatly prevented  
14 by reducing air pollution. And premature death  
15 caused by respiratory illnesses can be significantly  
16 cut with the reduction of carbon emissions. Further  
17 example hits close to home. Scientists have linked  
18 the increase in the frequency of pandemics as a  
19 result of climate change. That's right, if we don't  
20 make a sizable impact in limiting carbon emissions  
21 soon, crises like the COVID-19 pandemic might become  
22 all too common.

23           Finally, I am aware that some of my  
24 colleagues equate a renewable energy and an  
25 alternative energy future with negative economic

1 impact and job loss. This is simply not true. In  
2 our neighboring states, RGGI members have proven  
3 beneficial for creating jobs, reducing electricity  
4 prices and generating billions of dollars of revenue  
5 to be invested in clean energy projects.

6           Electricity rates have fallen 5.7  
7 percent in RGGI states, meaning more money in  
8 utility users' pockets. Our neighbors are outpacing  
9 other states by 31 percent in economic growth due to  
10 their RGGI membership. Pennsylvania is projected to  
11 add 27,000 jobs and generate nearly 2 billion by  
12 joining the initiative.

13           Since I only have a short amount of  
14 time, I also just want to mention that in  
15 conversations with my constituents, there has been  
16 such an up-tick in flood damage to properties,  
17 negative effects by the storms that the gentleman  
18 before me had mentioned. And this is yet another  
19 reason why we need to join RGGI.

20           In conclusion, this is a well operated  
21 and successful initiative that sets the standard for  
22 a greener future. Joining RGGI would solidify  
23 Pennsylvania's commitment to clean air and water,  
24 the health of our residents and necessary economic  
25 growth. It is a regional partnership and could help

1 us make a real difference in the future of each and  
2 every Pennsylvanian.

3 Sustainability is not an option. It  
4 is the only path forward. Thank you very much.

5 CHAIR: Thank you, Representative  
6 Shusterman. Next up, with have number five, Laura  
7 Jacko.

8 MS. JACKO: Okay. Hi.

9 CHAIR: Hello, Laura.

10 MS. JACKO: Hi, great. You can hear  
11 me. This is Laura Jacko, spelled L-A-U-R-A, Jacko,  
12 J-A-C-K-O. I live in Verona, PA, ZIP Code 15147.  
13 And I would like to submit my testimony in support  
14 of the RGGI or RGGI (changes pronunciation)  
15 initiative.

16 Firstly, as has been mentioned, all  
17 states in the northeast are part of this initiative,  
18 except for Pennsylvania. And I, too, would like to  
19 see PA be a leader and not a state that lags behind  
20 its neighbors.

21 We should really be out front of  
22 everything instead of lagging behind what everybody  
23 else has already tried and proven to be successful.  
24 States like New York have seen millions in RGGI  
25 auction proceeds go towards efforts to improve



1 energy efficiency, reduce greenhouse gas emissions  
2 and train workers for green energy jobs. These all  
3 seem like great things to me.

4                   Programs like this show that the idea  
5 of, you know, environment versus jobs or the  
6 environment or jobs is false. You don't pick one or  
7 the other. Initiatives like this show that there  
8 are initiatives out there that are pro-environment  
9 and pro-jobs, as well as helping people and  
10 businesses save money through energy efficiency  
11 programs. This is something we all need now  
12 especially with the pandemic. I'm sure everybody  
13 and every business could use money - money savings.

14                   Additionally, I live at home with an  
15 asthmatic husband and a son who was born  
16 prematurely. It's in our personal interest that we  
17 all reduce emissions and pollution to help them live  
18 safe and healthy lives. My three-year-old boy's  
19 health has been at risk from the moment that he was  
20 born prematurely. And we also all know that air  
21 pollution is a factor in premature births as well.  
22 So some things like this could have even been a  
23 cause. I really don't know.

24                   And science has shown that air  
25 pollution absolutely will, over the course of his

1 lifetime, take a toll on his life and his health.  
2 So - and very importantly, overall - I've heard this  
3 from several people already and I'm sure you'll hear  
4 a lot more people speak about climate change. It is  
5 not an option anymore for us to take bold and  
6 decisive action so that we and our children can have  
7 a livable planet.

8 I believe in science and I'm very  
9 concerned about the state of the world and  
10 Pennsylvania specifically. I care about my child's  
11 future and I want my lawmakers and regulators to  
12 care as well. We are well past the time to act on  
13 these types of initiatives. To me it's an easy ask  
14 to have PA sign on to the RGGI initiative. It is  
15 pro jobs, pro good jobs, pro health and pro  
16 environment.

17 If our Commonwealth does not protect  
18 our health and our ability to live on our own planet  
19 and is not supportive of good paying jobs that are  
20 part of where our economic future is inevitably  
21 headed, it is not acting in the best interests of  
22 every single citizen of Pennsylvania. Please  
23 approve this initiative and help PA recover from the  
24 Coronavirus devastation in a sustainable and  
25 healthier way. Frankly, there is just no other

1 option that exists. Thank you so much for your  
2 time. Good evening.

3 CHAIR: Thank you, Laura.

4 Next up, we have number six. Michele  
5 Mitchell. Do we have Michele on the line?

6 MS. MITCHELL: Yeah.

7 CHAIR: Hi, Michele.

8 MS. MITCHELL: Oh, hi. Hi, thank you.

9 Good evening. Thank you for the  
10 opportunity to share my thoughts today. My name is  
11 Michele Mitchell, M-I-C-H-E-L-E, M-I-T-C-H-E-L-L.  
12 And I am a resident of Selinsgrove, Pennsylvania,  
13 17870. I am a member of the Susquehanna Valley  
14 Chapters of Climate Reality Project and Citizen's  
15 Climate Lobby.

16 And I am testifying in support of  
17 Pennsylvania joining the Regional Greenhouse Gas  
18 Initiative, RGGI. I am a lifelong resident of  
19 Snyder County, a retired registered nurse, the  
20 mother of three sons and grandmother to five  
21 precious children. I share these roles with you  
22 because they are the reason that I wanted to testify  
23 here today. I am in the habit of checking my smart  
24 phone for the weather and recently was surprised to  
25 see that the air quality has been added to other

1 weather predictions. I was even more surprised to  
2 see that the air quality assessment for the day in  
3 question was rated as poor.

4 I am grateful to live in a fairly  
5 rural area and have believed our air quality to be  
6 generally quite good. In 2017, however,  
7 Pennsylvania was responsible for emission of  
8 approximately 263 million metric tons of carbon  
9 dioxide equivalent into the atmosphere. Production  
10 and consumption of energy accounted for nearly 90  
11 percent of these emissions.

12 Actually, according to the  
13 Commonwealth's Environmental Quality Board,  
14 Pennsylvania's electricity generating units known as  
15 EGUs ranked fourth among the highest CO2 emitted  
16 EGUs in the country.

17 One of my nursing roles was as a  
18 respiratory nurse specialist, which means I cared  
19 for people with chronic obstructive lung disease,  
20 COPD and asthma. These individuals are negatively  
21 impacted by poor air quality. By reducing carbon  
22 pollution, with the added benefit of lowering  
23 pollution, nitrogen oxide, sulfur dioxide and  
24 particulates, we have the opportunity to decrease  
25 morbidity and mortality from lung disease. I concur

1 with one of the previous presenters, but think the  
2 statistics are important enough to reiterate them.

3           Additionally, a study from Columbia  
4 University found that reduction of air pollution in  
5 RGGI states has decreased the incidents of childhood  
6 asthma, pre-term births and low birth weights.  
7 Predictions are that after ten years of  
8 participation in RGGI, we will have saved the lives  
9 of 639 people, avoided 40,000 asthma attacks in  
10 children, prevented 83,000 lost work days and saved  
11 healthcare costs estimated by the EPA to be in the  
12 hundreds of millions of dollars.

13           For patients with lung disease and for  
14 my own family, please don't allow Pennsylvania to be  
15 the only mid-Atlantic state which has not signed on  
16 to this lifesaving initiative. Thank you for your  
17 time and consideration.

18           CHAIR: Thank you, Michele. Next, we  
19 have number seven, Alison Rupert.

20           MS. RUPERT: Hi.

21           Can you hear me okay?

22           CHAIR: We can hear you. Go ahead,  
23 Alison.

24           MS. RUPERT: Okay. Thank you.

25           My name is Alison Rupert,

1 A-L-I-S-O-N, R-U-P-E-R-T. My husband and I are  
2 senior citizens. We've lived in Penn Township in a  
3 very rural part of Lycoming County in north central  
4 Pennsylvania. I'm speaking tonight to strongly  
5 support the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative. I  
6 applaud our Department of Environmental Protection  
7 for stepping up to address global warming, in  
8 contrast to our Pennsylvania legislators, who  
9 shamefully continue to ignore the harm caused by  
10 fossil fuel pollution to PA citizens and to the rest  
11 of our planet.

12                   The question's no longer whether or  
13 not global warming is a real threat or whether or  
14 not fossil fuel emissions are accelerating global  
15 warming or whether or not these emissions cause  
16 human illness and death. The question is when is  
17 our Pennsylvania government going to start doing  
18 something about it. The PA Constitution clearly  
19 guarantees our communities the right to clean air.

20                   It's embarrassing and frightening that  
21 Pennsylvania's power plants are the fifth dirtiest  
22 in the United States. It's embarrassing and  
23 frightening that Pennsylvania is the third largest  
24 greenhouse gas producer in the United States. Our  
25 state needs to catch up with the 21st century and

1 the ten forward thinking northeastern and mid-  
2 Atlantic states that are already benefitting from  
3 the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative.

4 My Pennsylvania senator is trying to  
5 scare his constituents by claiming that RGGI could  
6 possibly increase our electric bills. What he fails  
7 to mention is the billions of dollars RGGI will save  
8 our citizens in health-related economic costs due to  
9 premature deaths, heart attacks and respiratory  
10 illness. He doesn't mention that joining RGGI will  
11 bring a net increase of tens of thousands of PA  
12 jobs. I wish he would take the long view and set  
13 this and other clean air plans in motion now for a  
14 better future. Time is of the essence. Doing  
15 nothing, as he suggests, is a recipe for disaster.

16 I personally descend from a long line  
17 of farmers who would say a stitch in time saves nine  
18 and don't be pennywise but pound foolish. I descend  
19 also from a long line of clergymen who would say you  
20 are your brother's keeper. Pennsylvania should heed  
21 their time-honored advice and join the Regional  
22 Greenhouse Gas - Gas Initiative. My husband and I  
23 strongly support this effort. Thank you very much.

24 CHAIR: Thank you, Alison.

25 Next up will be number eight, Garlie

1 St-Cyr.

2 MS. ST-CYR: Hi.

3 Can you guys hear me?

4 CHAIR: Yes, we can. I will start  
5 your timer.

6 MS. ST-CYR: All right. Thank you.

7 This is Garlie St-Cyr, G-A-R-L-I-E,  
8 last name S-T, hyphen, C-Y-R. And I am a resident  
9 of Morrisville, Pennsylvania, in Bucks County.  
10 Thank you for allowing me to --- this opportunity to  
11 speak to you all to voice my support for the  
12 Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative.

13 The air quality in Pennsylvania has  
14 grown increasingly alarming for me and my family  
15 that has asthma, including my mother who developed  
16 worsening asthma symptoms after immigrating to the  
17 U.S. Between 2008 and 2015, the prevalence of  
18 asthma in Pennsylvania has nearly doubled according  
19 to our state health department. This presents a  
20 burden, especially for black and Latino families  
21 across Pennsylvania, especially during the rise of  
22 cases of COVID-19.

23 We are facing several crises like  
24 racism, public health, climate change and the  
25 economy. And these issues will continue to hamper



1 the quality of life for Pennsylvanians. Little do  
2 some people know that these are intersecting issues  
3 and correlate with one another. I see the - I see  
4 RGGI as a comprehensive way to show constituents  
5 that our leaders and state organizations care about  
6 them by implementing a multi-disciplinary approach  
7 like this one to address these needs.

8           This program will not only create over  
9 90,000 clean energy jobs, but has been proven by  
10 Columbia University to reduce our carbon footprint  
11 and air pollution. As a public health major, I  
12 understand how important making decisions in the  
13 interest of prevention is from a health and cost  
14 perspective extremely beneficial to how we move  
15 forward as a state. I hope that the Environmental  
16 Quality Board and all of the other stakeholders  
17 involved will consider our comments and the needs of  
18 its constituents under this valuable and sustainable  
19 investment. Thank you.

20           CHAIR: Thank you.

21           Next up we have Sarah Martik. Is  
22 Sarah on the line?

23           MS. MARTIK: Yes. I'm - I'm here.  
24 Can you hear me?

25           CHAIR: Yes, I can hear you. I'm

1 going to start your timer.

2 MS. MARTIK: Thank you.

3 My name is Sarah Martik. I am a  
4 resident of Coal Center, PA, and my name is spelled  
5 S-A-R-A-H, M-A-R-T-I-K. And for the record, I have  
6 submitted a written copy of my testimony tonight.

7 I offer comments today in support of  
8 the supposed regulations to establish the CO2 budget  
9 trading program. I offer these comments with much  
10 respect to the DEP and Governor for taking on a  
11 difficult and politically sensitive challenge and  
12 with the hopes that my comments will speak to the  
13 desired impacts of this program beyond the desired  
14 reduction in CO2 emissions.

15 I know what it means to live in an  
16 area that was once dominated by the production of  
17 coal. I literally live in Coal Center, PA. It  
18 means that as the power of the coal industry has  
19 declined over the past few decades, areas similar to  
20 mine have seen little investment to stem the  
21 bleeding brought on by economic hardship and the  
22 lost opportunities.

23 For areas that are clinging to power  
24 production as one of their last remaining economic  
25 drivers, I understand the concerns that they have

1 about implementing this program. My own town was  
2 spared some of the worst impacts of the declining  
3 coal by the presence of the California University of  
4 Pennsylvania. It's a source of good jobs for  
5 hundreds of people, and more than that, it  
6 tremendously benefits the community.

7 I, myself, went to a free preschool at  
8 CalU. I learned to swim in their pools in classes  
9 taught by their swim team. I attended a low cost  
10 but nationally accredited performing arts academy  
11 there. And my high school job at the local Dairy  
12 Queen relied on students and employees from the  
13 university coming in to eat every day. If it sounds  
14 like this one institution helped to shape my life,  
15 that's because it did. And by extension,  
16 investments by the state shaped my life.

17 The revenues generated by the RGGI  
18 program have the ability to do the same thing for so  
19 many like me. We know that cap and trade programs  
20 typically place additional burdens on environmental  
21 justice communities, especially communities of  
22 color. I am very concerned that statewide carbon  
23 emissions could lower overall, while the burdens of  
24 dirty air increases on the shoulders of EJ  
25 communities.

1                   However, we also know that RGGI is an  
2 economic driver. \$300 million in revenue is  
3 expected to be generated in the first year for PA.  
4 I want to make sure that we utilize this new revenue  
5 to really investment in communities that need it  
6 most. Prioritizing a shift to a sustainable, clean  
7 power source is a good start. I want to see PA  
8 invest in renewable energy infrastructure and energy  
9 efficiency developments.

10                   But I also want to see other site  
11 specific quality of life investments, too, such as  
12 investments in pre-K, development of green space,  
13 funding for low cost or no cost tutoring programs or  
14 art programs, things that people can point to and  
15 say this shaped who I am.

16                   I'm aware of the statistics pointing  
17 to RGGI being a jobs creator, with an expected net  
18 increase of about 27,000 jobs and \$1.9 billion added  
19 to the state's economy by 2030. However, I want to  
20 make one clear point about jobs and investments into  
21 new projects. The cycle of plastic from fracking  
22 and cracking to burning plastic waste should not  
23 receive one dime of investment from the RGGI  
24 program. Investment into industries like that would  
25 indicate to me that involvement in RGGI is at face

1 value only, that we as a state do not really care  
2 about meeting the challenges of climate change, nor  
3 do we really care about the holistic wellbeing of  
4 people in our Commonwealth.

5 I'm excited to be able to engage in  
6 this process, and I look forward to seeing what we  
7 as Pennsylvanians can do when we step up to take on  
8 challenge on climate change. As one of the highest  
9 greenhouse gas emitters in the country, we have a  
10 responsibility to do this work. And in the process,  
11 though, I ask that the state be unapologetically  
12 firm in re-investing in the overall quality of life  
13 for residents who most need that investment. Thank  
14 you.

15 CHAIR: Thank you, Sarah.

16 Next up, we have number ten, Mark  
17 Dugan.

18 MR. DUGAN: Hi, can you hear me?

19 CHAIR: Do we have Mark? Yes, we can  
20 hear you.

21 MR. DUGAN: Hi, my name is Mark Dugan.  
22 It's M-A-R-K, D-U-G-A-N. And I am a resident of  
23 Canonsburg in Washington County. I just want to say  
24 first, thank you for the opportunity to speak at  
25 this virtual public hearing.

1 I'm speaking in support of RGGI  
2 tonight. I have lived in southwestern Pennsylvania  
3 my entire life. My family lived and worked in  
4 Greene County as coal miners. My grandfather was a  
5 miner, a mine engineer and foreman for Duquesne  
6 Light until his retirement in the 1990s.

7 Coal mining was not only a source of  
8 income, but a way of life for him and many others in  
9 the region. However, this way of life also came at  
10 a price, both economically and physically. In 2003  
11 my grandfather, like many others, passed away  
12 because of Black Lung complications. For decades,  
13 coal communities have seen a gradual decrease in  
14 population size and economic opportunities.

15 Yet, RGGI is a program that I believe  
16 can address both the lack of jobs and further  
17 protecting the environment, not only in southwestern  
18 Pennsylvania, but the Commonwealth as a whole. The  
19 inevitable shift from fossil fuels to clean energy  
20 is already happening. RGGI proceeds can be  
21 reinvested to ease that transition and to build a  
22 clean energy economy for the future.

23 We should not miss out on the  
24 opportunity to clean up our environment while  
25 creating thousands of durable family sustaining

1 jobs. This revenue can create jobs in sustainable  
2 industries across the Commonwealth in rural and  
3 urban communities. It can help finance a just  
4 transition by creating new sustainable employment  
5 opportunities.

6                   Additionally, according to the DEP,  
7 RGGI has forecasted 27,000 plus jobs can be created  
8 under RGGI and add \$1.9 billion to our state's  
9 economy. It will lower CO2 emissions, which  
10 Pennsylvania ranks in the top five for highest  
11 annual CO2 emissions. And states that have  
12 implemented RGGI have been able to cut pollution by  
13 a third. And RGGI could help convert coal fired  
14 power plants into a renewable energy source. If  
15 Pennsylvania were to adopt energy, the state could  
16 receive hundreds of millions of dollars in proceeds  
17 as well.

18                   This funding should be invested back  
19 into historically disadvantaged communities to keep  
20 schools from closing and investing in existing  
21 educational opportunities, investing in the local  
22 family owned businesses and shops. It will allow  
23 for roads to be maintained and repaired and allow  
24 for more green spaces and land for recreation and  
25 outdoor activities. In conclusion, RGGI is a job

1 creation opportunity and a way for the Commonwealth  
2 to tackle climate change and pollution. Thank you  
3 for considering my testimony.

4 CHAIR: Thank you, Mark.

5 Next up we have number 11, Nick Hood.  
6 Do we have Nick on?

7 MR. HOOD: Hello? Hello?

8 CHAIR: Hi, Nick.

9 MR. HOOD: Hi there.

10 Hi, everybody. My name is Nicholas  
11 Hood. It's N-I-C-H-O-L-A-S, H-O-O-D. I live in  
12 Washington, PA, 15301. I was born and raised here  
13 in the county and both of my parents were also  
14 raised in the county. And my grandparents also grew  
15 up in the county as well. So I have a long lineage  
16 of people living in Washington County. And I own a  
17 home in the county. And I plan on staying in the  
18 area. But I do have many concerns.

19 Where - where I live, I see the  
20 perpetual moving away from coal mining and the coal  
21 burning power plants and the transfer from non-  
22 renewable to renewable sources for power generation  
23 is currently happening, even in this area. And RGGI  
24 could help accommodate the job market that could  
25 soon be filled with ex-coal miners or other



1 extraction workers.

2                   The argument that RGGI would kill jobs  
3 just isn't true. And it's harmful rhetoric pushed  
4 by big industry. Because by 2020 - by 2030, it's  
5 projected that RGGI would actually add a ton of  
6 jobs, 27,000 plus, and as well add a substantial  
7 amount of money to the economy, almost \$2 billion.

8                   And as a state we need to join RGGI  
9 because it's a perfect opportunity to help prepare  
10 us for these upcoming economic and job market  
11 challenges.

12                   Yeah. That's what I have. Thank you  
13 for your time.

14                   CHAIR: Oh gosh, I did it again. I  
15 was talking. Thank you, Nicholas. Next up we have  
16 number 12, Erich Everbach. Do we have Erich  
17 Everbach on?

18                   MR. EVERBACH: Hello. Good evening.

19                   CHAIR: All right, Erich.

20                   MR. EVERBACH: Yes.

21                   My name is Erich Everbach. The first  
22 name is spelled E-R-I-C-H. Last name Everbach,  
23 E-V-E-R-B-A-C-H. I live in Wallingford,  
24 Pennsylvania, 19086, in Delaware County in the  
25 western suburbs of Philadelphia.

1                   As a Pennsylvania resident for 30  
2 years and an engineering professor at Swarthmore  
3 College also for 30 years, I studied and taught  
4 about the evolution of technologies from the wheel  
5 to the satellite. I've also taught courses on the  
6 steam engine, the internal combustion engine, solar  
7 energy systems and wind turbine design.

8                   It is time for fossil fuel  
9 technologies to gradually pass into history and be  
10 replaced by low carbon emitting technologies like  
11 wind and solar. This transition requires policies,  
12 such as a CO2 budget trading program like RGGI. And  
13 I offer testimony now for why.

14                   In my solar energy systems class, my  
15 students and I consider smart grid technology  
16 policy, and even take a field trip to PJM  
17 Interconnect, the northeast electric grid operator.  
18 I teach how the Spot market, that's S-P-O-T, the  
19 Spot market and the day ahead market, for production  
20 of megawatts sets the price and determines the  
21 incentives both for production by power producing  
22 entities like our local PECO and also for reduction  
23 in demand by entities like Swarthmore College.

24                   A cap-and-trade program such as RGGI  
25 has been effective in reducing both carbon emissions

1 and the cost of those emission reductions overtime.  
2 This market-based mechanism is the most efficient  
3 way we know to reduce emissions. But why reduce  
4 emissions? What about clean coal?

5                    Burning natural gas is cleaner than  
6 burning coal and it's inexpensive in Pennsylvania.  
7 So why do we need RGGI? Well, it's true that  
8 hydraulic fracturing has produced more inexpensive  
9 natural gas, but has also produced huge methane  
10 emissions, much worse than the savings and the  
11 switch from coal. Currently, we do not charge  
12 anyone for venting methane or leaking accidentally  
13 from wellheads or pipelines. Despite technological  
14 advances, there is no clean way to mine coal or  
15 extract frack gas or move those products without  
16 pipeline leaks or danger to Pennsylvanians.

17                    The reason we need RGGI is to  
18 incentivize innovation. Americans are very good at  
19 innovations if public policy entities, like  
20 Pennsylvania's DEP, provide the right incentives.

21                    Why reduce emissions? Well, you've  
22 heard from previous speakers, particulate and NOX  
23 and SOX pollution, and --- increases that follow in  
24 asthma, bronchitis and other diseases, which are  
25 expensive and tragic, especially in children because

1 these diseases last their whole lives. And it's  
2 been said by previous speakers, something like \$6  
3 billion can be saved in healthcare costs in  
4 Pennsylvania through 2030 due to reduced pollution.

5 Carbon in the atmosphere, which is  
6 going to result in greater storms and droughts, loss  
7 of crops, mass migration of people and an  
8 existential threat to the lives that Pennsylvanians  
9 hold dear. Global climate change is not a hoax and  
10 is already starting to bite us.

11 According to the UNFCCC, carbon  
12 reductions have got to be aggressive before 2030 or  
13 we may tip the climate into something very different  
14 than what Pennsylvania has been founded on. This is  
15 an irreversible change after a certain point, so we  
16 need to act now.

17 Finally, Pennsylvania should  
18 participate in the green economy that's coming,  
19 indeed, is already here, showing leadership among  
20 the states and employing workers from fossil fuel  
21 companies. You know the estimates as well as I do.  
22 You've heard them today. And you will continue to  
23 hear them. But clearly tens of thousands of good  
24 jobs are coming if we move forward with green  
25 infrastructure, which relies on low carbon

1 electricity. These are good reasons to incentivize  
2 low carbon technologies over fossil fuels in the  
3 most efficient manner possible.

4                   Joining the other regional partner  
5 states in RGGI is what Pennsylvania needs now. I  
6 urge you to do the right thing for our workers, our  
7 asthmatic children and elders, our land, air and  
8 water and the future generations of Pennsylvanians.  
9 History has its eyes on you. Thank you for  
10 considering my testimony at this hearing.

11                   CHAIR: Thank you, Eric.

12                   Next up, we have number 13, Mark  
13 Fichman. Do we have mark on the line?

14                   MR. FICHMAN: Yeah, I'm here.

15                   CHAIR: Hi, Mark. Go ahead.

16                   MR. FICHMAN: Thank you very much.

17                   Thank you for giving me the  
18 opportunity to testify. My name is Mark Fichman,  
19 M-A-R-K, F-I-C-H-M-A-N. I am an emeritus professor  
20 of business at Carnegie Mellon University of  
21 Pittsburgh. I live in Pittsburgh.

22                   I support Pennsylvania entering into  
23 RGGI. I think the case for doing this based on  
24 greenhouse gasses and mitigating global climate  
25 change is compelling and should be sufficient reason

1 to join RGGI. I want to add three different  
2 observations. I want to make the business case,  
3 apart from the social and human welfare case, which  
4 is sufficient in and of itself.

5 If Pennsylvania joins - one, if  
6 Pennsylvania joins RGGI, additional funds would be  
7 generated that would add money and jobs into the  
8 economy. When you create a marketplace for carbon  
9 and carbon offsets, money will flow to projects  
10 which will reduce carbon at lowest costs.

11 There's a concrete illustration  
12 happening in Pittsburgh right now. In Pittsburgh,  
13 the Rice Brothers have invested in EQT and Rice  
14 Energy, both large national gas companies. So  
15 they've now formed a company called Rice Acquisition  
16 with \$237 million. Their business is focused on de-  
17 carbonization. Here's what they say to their  
18 investors, and these are all big money folks.  
19 Quote, we believe the widespread adoption of  
20 renewable fuels by major sectors of the economy,  
21 such as freight, air and marine transportation,  
22 residential and industrial heating, power generation  
23 and energy storage will create a profound  
24 disruption, resulting in a very large market. So  
25 here you see oil and gas investors recognizing the

1 transition away from carbon is with us now.

2                   Second point. The cost for renewable  
3 energies is declining and will continue to decline.  
4 Businesses - investor bank Lazard has developed the  
5 process for renewable energy contrasts with  
6 hydrocarbon based energy. The latest annual  
7 levelized cost of energy analysis shows that the  
8 cost for renewable energy continues to decline with  
9 solar and on shore wind become cost competitive with  
10 conventional generation on a basis, continuing to  
11 maintain competitiveness and the marginal costs of  
12 existing conventional generation technologies.

13                   So the attraction of renewable energy  
14 will continue and will grow. RGGI initiative will  
15 enhance and support that move to renewables, which  
16 are commonly cost competitive.

17                   It's an interesting story. Utility  
18 companies are starting to realize this. In New  
19 Mexico, the public service company in New Mexico  
20 shut down a large coal plant with the plan of  
21 building a large natural gas plant in its place.  
22 This was in 2019. After being presented with  
23 arguments for building a facility using solar farms,  
24 wind batteries, they canceled the natural gas plant  
25 and they built the renewable plant in its place.

1 RGGI will support that.

2                   The third aspect of the business case.

3     Pennsylvania could join RGGI, discover their right  
4 to do it, and the benefits will outweigh the costs.

5     This is a true positive that will be a good result.

6     Pennsylvania can decide not to join the RGGI,  
7 discover the benefits don't outweigh the costs.

8     This is very unlikely, but some people discount  
9 global warming and value hydrocarbon based

10 economies.

11                   As a business person, I know there are  
12 two other possibilities. Pennsylvania could join  
13 RGGI and find out it did not provide the expected  
14 benefits. This would be a false positive. This  
15 would be like buying insurance on your house and  
16 never making a claim.

17                   Finally, Pennsylvania could decide not  
18 to join the RGGI when, in fact, the RGGI would have  
19 been beneficial both economically and in reducing  
20 climate change. The cost of being wrong on the  
21 investment, again, is a few billion dollars. The  
22 cost of being wrong on climate change is  
23 catastrophic that will change the lives of my  
24 children and my grandchildren and all of us in  
25 unimaginably awful ways.



1                   Being wrong on climate change and  
2 foregoing opportunities to reduce it has a far  
3 greater cost than being right on climate change.  
4 This is what business people call a false negative.  
5 This is like not buying insurance on your house and  
6 then you have a fire. So the cost of a false  
7 negative, being wrong about climate change and  
8 thinking it doesn't matter, is far greater than if  
9 you decide - if you're wrong on climate change and,  
10 in fact, buy the insurance.

11                   So for those reasons, I support RGGI  
12 and encourage the DEP to encourage our legislators  
13 to pass that. Thank you very much.

14                   CHAIR: Thank you, Mark.

15                   Next up, we have number 14. Michelle  
16 Bentley. Do we have Michelle on the line?

17                   MS. BENTLEY: Can you hear me?

18                   CHAIR: Yep, we can hear you.

19                   MS. BENTLEY: My name is Michelle  
20 Bentley, spelled M-I-C-H-E-L-L-E, B-E-N-T-L-E-Y. I  
21 am a resident of Lancaster, Pennsylvania, 17603. I  
22 am providing testimony as a private citizen on the  
23 proposed rulemaking CO2 budget trading program.

24                   As a child in the 1960s, I grew up in  
25 a coastal environment in Connecticut that adhered to

1 sound ecological principles and the stewarding of  
2 clean air, water and land. In the 1970s, I  
3 participated in what was at the time a back to the  
4 land movement living in Vermont, where  
5 environmentalism was not just a word, but a way of  
6 life. In the '80s and the '90s, I lived in two well  
7 known polluted environments in our country, the  
8 lower west side of Manhattan, long before there was  
9 gentrification, and adjacent to the oil refineries  
10 in Houston, Texas.

11 In these two situations, I experienced  
12 firsthand what living in less than ideal air and  
13 water quality felt like. I also witnessed the  
14 impact of environmental racism within the inter-city  
15 wards and was moved to participate in advocacy and  
16 action groups, spearheading initiatives related to  
17 food sourcing by assisting citizens in building  
18 community vegetable gardens.

19 Having a child while living in Houston  
20 prompted my family to reassess how our exposure to  
21 high levels of air pollution could impact our long-  
22 term health. Our living conditions of a below sea  
23 level topography, robust city expansion with little  
24 protective zoning regulations, combined with the  
25 increasing damaging storm surges, pointed to much

1 uncertainty for our safe and healthy future. This  
2 brought my family to move to Pennsylvania in 1998,  
3 where we have lived on the border of the City of  
4 Lancaster on two acres of land for 20 years.

5           What I have witnessed over these 20  
6 years is the initial flourishing and the subsequent  
7 slow and steady degradation of our natural habitat  
8 that was once abundant with flora and fauna as a  
9 result of climate change, coupled with the erosion  
10 of our water way border, Little Conestoga Creek,  
11 which is the 21.1-mile-long tributary of the  
12 Conestoga River in Pennsylvania.

13           As an individual who is deeply  
14 connected to my faith and our calling by God to care  
15 for creation, I support policies that protect our  
16 natural resources that sustain all earthly life. I  
17 also advocate for thoughtful multi-dimensional  
18 solutions that address our environmental crises,  
19 that impact disenfranchised populations in  
20 disproportionate ways, equating to environmental  
21 racism, leaving these minority populations exposed  
22 to higher rates of pollution, radiation,  
23 contamination in their food, water and living  
24 environment with little or no access to voice their  
25 concerns.

1                   By supporting the Regional Greenhouse  
2 Gas Initiative cap-and-invest program, it is my hope  
3 that it will incentivize change amongst the biggest  
4 polluters in Pennsylvania and our surrounding  
5 states. It is also my hope that the Regional  
6 Greenhouse Gas Initiative cap-and-investment program  
7 will distribute those funds to the poorest people  
8 first, while advocating for policies that shift to  
9 renewable resources and provide for better economic  
10 development, education, job training, housing  
11 stability and continued investment in underserved  
12 communities.

13                   As I digest today's news of the  
14 finalizing of an EPA rule that could prevent the  
15 strengthening measures to combat air pollution and  
16 the climate crisis in the future, I feel that  
17 supporting productive initiatives such as the  
18 Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative is our moral  
19 obligation and a definitive first step to helping to  
20 secure the sustainability of all life. I want to  
21 thank the EQB for listening to my testimony this  
22 evening. Thank you.

23                   CHAIR: Thank you, Michelle.

24                   Next up we have Dina Ischler  
25 (phonetic). But is Dina going to send her comments

1 in writing? Or is she still going to testify?

2 MR. JAGIELA: She'll only be  
3 submitting her comments via email.

4 CHAIR: Okay.

5 Then that means we go to number 17,  
6 Susan Clough. Susan, are you on the line?

7 MS. CLOUGH: Yes, I am. It's Clough  
8 (corrects pronunciation).

9 CHAIR: I'm sorry.

10 Clough (changes pronunciation). Go  
11 ahead.

12 MS. CLOUGH: So you can hear me.  
13 Susan, S-U-S-A-N, Clough, C-L-O-U-G-H. And I was -  
14 I have lived in the City of Lancaster, Pennsylvania,  
15 17603, for the past 20 years. I moved here in 1991  
16 from Monmouth County, New Jersey, where every day I  
17 could see the ocean and two rivers. Consequently,  
18 the environmental issues are close to my heart for a  
19 long time. For the past four years - oh. And I am  
20 also a mother of three sons and I have seven  
21 grandchildren. So there's seven more Cloughs - so  
22 there's 14 Cloughs in my immediate family that I  
23 want to save the future for.

24 For the past four years, I have been a  
25 substitute teacher in most of Lancaster County's

1 school systems. Extremely concerned about  
2 environmental issues, I care strongly about racial  
3 justice and also for my faith tradition I believe  
4 that we are responsible to be stewards, caring for  
5 our resources, including our children as well.

6 I am here asking you to support the  
7 RGGI initiative. Cutting carbon pollution will  
8 benefit our health and wellbeing, plus the resulting  
9 clean air fund, could help support improvements of  
10 the poor air quality that impacts our low income  
11 communities' health, especially and overall by  
12 climate change, with the changes in climate change.

13 RGGI will significantly reduce asthma  
14 emergency room visits. This illness alone affects  
15 the quality of school children's attendance and  
16 their education success. Since the proceeds from  
17 RGGI are added into the state's clean air fund, I  
18 hope this Lancaster school project could meet your  
19 idea of ways to invest this money effectively.  
20 Especially now with the COVID pandemic impacting  
21 inside air quality, fresh air spaces have become  
22 invaluable assets.

23 My specific story is about our city's  
24 high school, where two McCaskey - McCaskey - J.P.  
25 McCaskey is the name of the high school, or McCaskey

1 East. They're two separate, but are together.  
2 Anyway, McCaskey art teachers have challenged their  
3 students to create a beneficial outdoor learning  
4 environment from an unused patio space, one that  
5 would be shared by all the teachers and students on  
6 campus for additional curricular opportunities.

7 I've brought pictures of these to  
8 show, which obviously won't work. But the existing  
9 outdoor space is an exit from the main entrance from  
10 the parking lot for the teachers to get in if they  
11 have a pass. And it is really dreary, empty, awful  
12 looking. And so this - and then I have a picture  
13 for the accepted art project for this that has - the  
14 funding has started - well, anyway it has --- well,  
15 I'll tell you about it. Let's see. Where are my  
16 notes?

17 Using native plants and recycled and  
18 sustainable materials, they have designed their  
19 first area. The fundraising has already begun  
20 with -.

21 CHAIR: Susan, are you still there?  
22 Did anyone else lose her? Or was that just my  
23 internet connection?

24 MR. JAGIELA: I think we lost her.

25 CHAIR: Are you there, Susan?

1                   MS. CLOUGH: I'm here. I think I'm  
2 here.

3                   CHAIR: Okay. Sorry. We lost you  
4 there. You can - if you could - you've got about 45  
5 seconds left.

6                   MS. CLOUGH: If we do not lift up the  
7 quality of our student's education, challenged by  
8 the vast array of economic justice issues in our  
9 neighborhoods, how will they be healthy enough to  
10 excel and rise out of the possible cycle of poverty?  
11 The nature thing for this outdoor space was they'd  
12 not only be inspired by nature, they could breathe  
13 fresh air and feel energetic, creatively refreshed,  
14 restoring their thoughts to academic curiosity,  
15 inspired by these green spaces that they could  
16 create in wasted exterior space in those schools.

17                   You have the potential to benefit  
18 clean air for our children and grandchildren now and  
19 in their futures. I don't know whether - oh, I'm  
20 done. Thank you. Sorry for that.

21                   CHAIR: Thank you, Susan. If you  
22 could just make sure you can email your - your  
23 comments to reg comments at PA.gov, we'll make sure  
24 that we got everything that you said in that point  
25 where your audio went out.



1                   MS. CLOUGH: Okay. Thanks very much.  
2 Sorry about that.

3                   CHAIR: You, too. Oh, that's okay.  
4                   Next up, we have number 18, Liz  
5 Brunton. Do we have Liz on the line?

6                   MS. BRUNTON: I am here. Thank you.

7                   CHAIR: Hi, Liz.

8                   MS. BRUNTON: Hi.

9                   Good evening. My name is Liz Brunton,  
10 L-I-Z, B-R-U-N-T-O-N. And I am a lifelong resident  
11 of Pennsylvania, residing now in Norristown for the  
12 last 35 years. Thank you for the opportunity to  
13 share my testimony at this virtual public hearing.  
14 The focus of my testimony will come from my  
15 experience as a grandchild of lifelong coal region  
16 folk, and my fervent belief in the new green economy  
17 and the future of Pennsylvania in the northeastern  
18 region of the United States.

19                   Growing up, at least twice a quarter,  
20 my family would drive the two and a half hours from  
21 Glenside to Ashland to visit with my retired coal  
22 miner granddad. He and my grandmother lived two  
23 blocks from the Ashland Mine, which at that time had  
24 been converted into a tourist attraction with modest  
25 success. The ride through coal country and with the

1 mountainous piles of shale waste and the dying or  
2 dead towns with life only showing in tiny strip  
3 malls and diners was increasingly depressing as the  
4 years marched on.

5                   It was clear to this young person that  
6 coal was dying and taking the towns along with it.  
7 People my age graduated school and left town the  
8 next day, heading for college or jobs elsewhere,  
9 finding none in their town. Businesses once  
10 thriving on Main Street either found their way to  
11 move into the strips or closed up shop altogether.  
12 A few miles up the ridge would bring you Centralia,  
13 still famously burning underground.

14                   It took a lot of convincing to calm me  
15 down that the fire would not possibly travel down to  
16 my grandparent's modest house, maintained by  
17 granddad's Black Lung insurance payment. There is  
18 now no dispute that the few remaining coal plants in  
19 Pennsylvania are in their final death throes and are  
20 increasingly uneconomical to boot.

21                   Thanks to market forces driven by  
22 cheaper gas and renewable, 18 coal fire plants in PA  
23 have already closed or transitioned into gas in  
24 recent years. There are no plans on the table to  
25 build more. Coal share of the state's energy

1 production has dropped from 55 percent to 17 percent  
2 since 2005, while the market share for natural gas  
3 has increased.

4                   That is why Pennsylvania must plan for  
5 the transition that is already happening and to  
6 prepare Pennsylvania workers for the energy jobs of  
7 the future and to bring Pennsylvania into that  
8 future by ensuring we meet the constitutional  
9 mandate of a livable planet with clear air and pure  
10 water.

11                   During the past ten years since its  
12 inception and adoption in all our neighboring  
13 states, RGGI states saw 31 percent more overall  
14 economic growth than states that do not regulate  
15 carbon emissions. So RGGI is not a job killer.

16                   A just transition does not mean fewer  
17 jobs. In fact, just the reverse. RGGI is protected  
18 to create 27,000 Pennsylvania jobs and boost the  
19 economy by nearly \$2 billion between now and 2030.  
20 A just transition for all is possible for us,  
21 especially if practical efforts are baked into the  
22 rulemaking. I am championing a just transition  
23 for workers in the extracted energy economy towards  
24 short and long-term jobs that provide living wages  
25 for families, ensure retirement pensions and create

1 dignified working conditions.

2                   And a just transition for communities  
3 that have relied on fossil fuel extraction for  
4 revenues to support public services, such as good  
5 schools and local economy. Job training, placement  
6 programs and the like can be fed by RGGI funds, to  
7 ensure these folks transition successfully to a new  
8 green economy and ensure pension and healthcare  
9 guarantees and investment in support of regenerative  
10 energy or sustainable business in the community and  
11 shore up lost revenue from power plant closures.

12                   It is critical that Pennsylvania steps  
13 forward to join our sister states who are already  
14 reaping the benefits of the RGGI program with  
15 cleaner air, cleaner water and a renewed purpose of  
16 living into the future. The world of my  
17 grandparents is long gone. Don't leave us behind  
18 with those ghosts of the past. Please help my child  
19 and the millions of children who will come after us  
20 thrive and prosper in a renewed Green world. Thank  
21 you so much for hearing my testimony tonight.

22                   CHAIR: Thank you, Liz. Next up, we  
23 have number 19, Thomas Schuster. Do we have you,  
24 Tom?

25                   MR. SCHUSTER: Yes.

1 Can you hear me?

2 CHAIR: We can hear you.

3 MR. SCHUSTER: Good evening, my name  
4 is Tom Schuster, spelled T-H-O-M-A-S, S-C-H-U-S-T-E-  
5 R. I live in Johnstown, Pennsylvania. I am the  
6 clean energy program director of the Pennsylvania  
7 chapter of the Sierra Club. I'm speaking on behalf  
8 of the chapter and our roughly 30,000 members in the  
9 Commonwealth.

10 The Sierra Club strongly supports the  
11 draft proposed CO2 budget trading program, which  
12 would place limits on CO2 emissions from fossil fuel  
13 power plants and linked to the Regional Greenhouse  
14 Gas Initiative. We urge the EQB to finalize the  
15 rulemaking as soon as possible, with some minor  
16 modifications. Pennsylvania needs to take a  
17 meaningful action to address its contribution to the  
18 climate crisis, because we are globally significant  
19 emitters of greenhouse gases.

20 In 2015, we emitted more energy  
21 related CO2 than 172 of the 194 nations that signed  
22 onto the Paris Climate Agreement. We know from the  
23 latest inter-governmental panel on climate change  
24 reports that globally we must reduce our emissions  
25 by at least 45 percent by 2030 and to net zero by

1 2050 to avoid the worst impacts of climate  
2 disruption, which would be extremely detrimental to  
3 our health, safety and economy.

4 RGGI is a necessary piece of the  
5 climate solution. It has a proven track record in  
6 growing the economy and improving public health.  
7 And it's projected to increase overall economic  
8 activity in Pennsylvania. The primary driver for  
9 this is the re-investment of allowance proceeds in  
10 ways that directly benefit consumers and have high  
11 multiplier effects.

12 Recent reports by the Analysis Group  
13 found that implementation of the program generated  
14 \$1.4 billion in economic value from 2015 to 2017 and  
15 created 14,500 job years, just during that time.  
16 Such a stimulus would be welcome in the wake of the  
17 economic downturn brought on by COVID-19.

18 Some have cited concerns about  
19 localized economic impacts that could result from  
20 RGGI induced generation shifts, in particular a  
21 decline in coal fire generation. But as the  
22 recently announced plan by Talen Energy to cease  
23 coal burning at the Montour Power Station makes  
24 clear, coal use will essentially end this decade,  
25 with or without RGGI. Because it is simply no

1 longer competitive. There are only four  
2 conventional coal plants left in the state that  
3 don't have plans to retire or stop burning coal or  
4 haven't already retired.

5 In 2010, there were 20 such plants.  
6 There's been no effort at the state level to help  
7 these communities to adapt. But going forward, RGGI  
8 could provide resources to help with just - with  
9 just that.

10 But it's abundantly clear that we  
11 cannot wait any longer to take significant action.  
12 Timing of emissions reductions is as important as  
13 the overall reduction amount. Since carbon dioxide  
14 persists in the atmosphere for decades, and its  
15 impacts compound due to feedback effects, a ton of  
16 pollution reduction today has much more value than a  
17 ton of pollution reduction in 5, 10 or even 20  
18 years. That's why we're heartened to see  
19 projections of robust short-term emissions  
20 reductions.

21 In order to ensure the most effective  
22 and equitable rule possible, we recommend the  
23 following minor adjustments, which we'll elaborate  
24 on in our written comments. First, DEP should  
25 conduct regular assessments of the levels of power

1 sector co-pollutants, to which environmental justice  
2 communities are exposed. If it's determined that a  
3 community is experiencing increased levels of co-  
4 pollutant exposure relative to a pre-RGGI baseline,  
5 the DEP should engage residents and leaders in that  
6 community to identify an appropriate remedy.

7           Secondly, the initial cap needs to be  
8 set at a level that is no higher than the actual  
9 emissions in the year before the program. 78  
10 million short tons in the draft rule looks good for  
11 now. But if the emissions from the power sector  
12 decline faster than expected, we may need to adjust  
13 that cap downward.

14           We appreciate the opportunity to  
15 comment, and again, urge the EQB to finalize the  
16 rule so that we can begin getting a handle on our  
17 climate disrupting emissions and give our children  
18 and grandchildren a fighting chance to bring this  
19 crisis under control. Thank you.

20           CHAIR: Thank you, Tom. Next, we have  
21 number 20, Linda Noonan. Linda, are you on the  
22 line?

23           MS. NOONAN: I am. Thank you.

24           My name is Linda Noonan, L-I-N-D-A, N-  
25 O-O-N-A-N. I am a resident of Haverford and I am



1 the senior pastor at Chestnut Hill United Church in  
2 Philadelphia.

3                   Implementing RGGI makes both moral and  
4 economic sense. As a state, we would not only live  
5 up to our constitutional responsibility to protect  
6 the right of all our citizens to clean air, but we  
7 would strengthen our economy and increase jobs.

8                   I am testifying tonight on behalf of  
9 my congregation, which is a member of Power  
10 Interfaith. Our church's environmental justice  
11 center has been advocating for our elected leaders  
12 to take meaningful action to address what has now  
13 become the climate crisis for the last 20 years. My  
14 congregation sees the ravages of climate change  
15 right now, right here in Philadelphia and across the  
16 state. Climate change and dirty energy  
17 disproportionately impact the most vulnerable among  
18 us, those living in poverty, communities of color,  
19 the elderly and young children.

20                   We're thus called by our faith to  
21 address the causes of climate change as a moral  
22 imperative, hence our support for RGGI. We need to  
23 work hard to wean ourselves off fossil fuels as  
24 quickly as possible. This includes, of course, the  
25 coal and natural gas burned in the power plants that

1 are the targets of RGGI. The harm done by dirty  
2 power plants touches all of us, but  
3 disproportionately hurts poor folk and people of  
4 color.

5                   These facilities are almost always  
6 built near low income black and brown communities,  
7 which suffer the highest rates of asthma,  
8 respiratory diseases and COVID-19. Unemployment in  
9 these areas is also higher. And the land is  
10 devalued because of environmental pollution.  
11 Cleaning up the pollution from these dirty plants  
12 will directly improve the health and economic  
13 stability of surrounding communities.

14                   Chestnut Hill United Church supports  
15 RGGI's market-based approach of putting a price on  
16 carbon pollution and offering financial incentives  
17 to the power plant owners to lower emissions.  
18 Corporations driven by doing what is best for their  
19 profit margins cannot be expected to voluntarily do  
20 what is best for the people and the planet. Rules  
21 like RGGI make it easier for corporations to do what  
22 is right, which only then makes it possible for the  
23 state to truly protect its citizens.

24                   We know that this approach works.  
25 Carbon pollution has been cut by 47 percent in the

1 other states that participate in RGGI, outpacing  
2 carbon pollution cuts in the rest of the country by  
3 90 percent. And not only did their economies not  
4 suffer, but they grew stronger. Economic growth in  
5 the RGGI states has outpaced the rest of the country  
6 by 31 percent during this time.

7                   An in-depth analysis for the State's  
8 Department of Environmental Protection has confirmed  
9 that Pennsylvania would have similar success. RGGI  
10 will lead to a net increase of more than 27,000 jobs  
11 and add \$1.9 billion to the state's economy by 2030.  
12 Our State Constitution guarantees Pennsylvania  
13 citizens an absolute right to clean air. This means  
14 that it's our constitutional responsibility, as well  
15 as our moral responsibility to push for clean air  
16 for every one of our citizens, no matter their  
17 class, health, race, age or ZIP Code.

18                   Chestnut Hill United Church commends  
19 Governor Wolf and his administration for recognizing  
20 that the road to a more equitable Pennsylvania leads  
21 through the prompt implementation of the Regional  
22 Greenhouse Gas Initiative. In his letter from a  
23 Birmingham jail, Martin Luther King, Junior, wrote  
24 it really boils down to this. That all life is  
25 inter-related. We are all caught in an inescapable

1 network of mutuality, tied into a single garment of  
2 destiny. Whatever affects one directly affects us  
3 all indirectly.

4 We must implement RGGI in Pennsylvania  
5 as soon as possible in service to Dr. King's  
6 recognition of the fully interconnectedness of every  
7 one of us. In other words, here in Pennsylvania  
8 when one of us can't breathe, none of us should  
9 breathe easy until we've done everything we can to  
10 protect us all. Thank you.

11 CHAIR: Thank you, Linda. Next we  
12 have number 21, Michele Fetting. Michele, are you  
13 on the line?

14 MS. FETTING: I'm here. Can you hear  
15 me?

16 CHAIR: We can hear you.

17 MS. FETTING: Well great, thank you.

18 This is Michele Fetting, spelled  
19 M-I-C-H-E-L-E, Fetting, F-E-T-T-I-N-G. And I live  
20 in Pittsburgh. I'd like to thank the Environmental  
21 Quality Board for holding this hearing and giving  
22 the citizens the opportunity to speak.

23 Pennsylvania should join the Regional  
24 Greenhouse Gas Initiative because it's time to clean  
25 up our act and protect our citizens. First, as the

1 third largest greenhouse gas polluting state, we  
2 have a huge responsibility for global climate  
3 change. We must transition away from digging up and  
4 burning fossil fuels for energy and to make plastic.  
5 This will not happen without strong and decisive  
6 action from our state leaders. Joining RGGI is just  
7 the beginning.

8 I live near the Cheswick Coal Fired  
9 Power Plant, one of the biggest sources of pollution  
10 in Allegheny County and the Pittsburgh region. It  
11 is the largest emitter of nitrogen oxides, sulfur  
12 dioxide, lead and mercury in the county and in the  
13 top five for benzene and carbon monoxide.

14 In 2018, I attended a public hearing  
15 on this plant at Springdale High School, Springdale  
16 being the birthplace of Rachel Carson. I was  
17 shocked to see at this - that this school sitting  
18 high on a hill above the Allegheny River was about  
19 at the same height as the smoke stacks from the  
20 Cheswick Plant. If the plant is operating on a day  
21 when the wind is blowing in the wrong direction, it  
22 will blow right into the high school where young  
23 children are learning.

24 The plant leaves a residue of soot on  
25 and inside homes in that area to quote a resident

1 who looks out her window at the plant, quote, it's  
2 like hell, living in hell. It's filthy, it's dirty,  
3 it's noisy, it's unhealthy, end quote.

4 I am also a cancer survivor, surviving  
5 multiple bouts with lymphoma as well as thyroid -  
6 thyroid nodules and breast cancer. There is no  
7 doubt my environment was at least partly responsible  
8 for my health issues. My mother and aunt died of  
9 brain tumors at age 58 in '61 after growing up on a  
10 coal seam in Fayette County.

11 We pay a lot, an awful lot, in health  
12 costs from these toxic industries. Pennsylvania  
13 needs a shift in our collective mindset around what  
14 smart and sustainable economic development looks  
15 like. RGGI can help us loosen the grip that the oil  
16 and gas industry has on our state. But we need  
17 more.

18 Let's work to end fossil fuel  
19 subsidies, such as the \$1.6 billion given to SHELL  
20 to build a toxic petro-chemical plastic factory,  
21 with infrastructure that emits not only greenhouse  
22 gases, but VOCs and radioactive material. Let's  
23 shift those investments to energy efficient  
24 retrofits for commercial and residential buildings,  
25 invest in projects that will benefit the public such

1 as zero pollution electric generation through solar  
2 and wind and projects like passenger rail and public  
3 transit infrastructure.

4                   Let's transition coal and gas workers  
5 to family sustaining jobs that don't harm workers or  
6 their families. Let's pay special attention to  
7 environmental justice areas and give leaders in low  
8 income areas and communities of color a seat at the  
9 table to define the economic development projects  
10 those communities want.

11                   RGGI is not perfect, but it will help  
12 ensure that communities in southwestern Pennsylvania  
13 and elsewhere are no longer sacrifice zones for  
14 coal, oil and gas to exploit long dead fossils for  
15 dirty energy. And perhaps best of all, RGGI will  
16 help create thousands of new jobs with an eye to the  
17 future. I am grateful for those in Pennsylvania's  
18 leadership who have supported the effort to join  
19 RGGI. I am excited to see how joining RGGI will  
20 improve the lives of all Pennsylvanians, especially  
21 those recovering from decades of environmental  
22 destruction. Thank you so much.

23                   CHAIR: Thank you, Michele. Next, we  
24 have number 22, Davis Coffey. Do we have Davis on  
25 the line?

1           MR. COFFEY: Hello?

2           CHAIR: Hi, Davis.

3           MR. COFFEY: Hello? Can you hear me?

4           CHAIR: Yes, we can hear you.

5           MR. COFFEY: Perfect.

6           Good evening. I thank you all for the  
7 opportunity to testify in support of Pennsylvania  
8 joining RGGI. My name is Davis Coffey, spelled D-A-  
9 V-I-S, C-O-F-F-E-Y. And as a student studying  
10 environmental science and global sustainability, I  
11 am very concerned about the harmful effects the  
12 anthropogenic sources, such as the fossil fuel  
13 industry have on the global climate.

14           I was born and raised in Richmond,  
15 Virginia and spent most of my childhood outside in  
16 the forests and exploring the James River. Growing  
17 up in such an outdoor paradise really inspired my  
18 love and respect for the natural world. When I  
19 found out this past June that Virginia is officially  
20 joining RGGI, I was ecstatic. Now it's time for  
21 Pennsylvania to do the same.

22           Pennsylvania plays an inexcusably  
23 outsized role in polluting our environment and is  
24 currently the fourth largest contributor of  
25 greenhouse gas emissions in the country. The



1 impacts of the climate crisis have become  
2 increasingly apparent with counties like Chester  
3 receiving an F in air quality by the American Lung  
4 Association. Pennsylvania's state tree, the eastern  
5 Hemlock, is expected to disappear from the state as  
6 a result of an insect that thrives in the warmer  
7 weather.

8                   As a major climate polluter,  
9 Pennsylvania has a responsibility to reduce its  
10 greenhouse gas emissions and develop a sustainable  
11 energy plan to ensure a livable future for the  
12 Commonwealth and its people. The good news is that  
13 RGGI is already a proven model for success.

14                   By joining RGGI, Pennsylvania can  
15 reduce carbon emissions by 188 million tons by 2030.  
16 The initiative is also projected to create 27,000  
17 new jobs in Pennsylvania and put nearly \$2 billion  
18 into the state's economy over the next decade alone.  
19 Joining RGGI would help avoid damage to the health  
20 of our residents, environment and climate, but also  
21 creating new economic opportunities to transition to  
22 a sustainable energy economy. Protecting the health  
23 and wellbeing of Pennsylvanian residents should be  
24 top priority, always.

25                   The Pennsylvania Constitution

1 guarantees that all residents in Pennsylvania have  
2 the right to clean drinking water and clean air to  
3 breathe. It is time to uphold that legal  
4 responsibility and join RGGI. Thank you so much for  
5 your time.

6 CHAIR: Thank you, Davis.

7 Next we have number 23, Karen Norvig  
8 Berry. Do we have Karen on the line?

9 MS. BERRY: I am on the line. I am on  
10 the line.

11 CHAIR: Hi Karen. Yep. We can hear  
12 you. Go ahead.

13 MS. BERRY: Okay.

14 Karen, K-A-R-E-N, Norvig,  
15 N-O-R-V-I-G, and Berry, B-E-R-R-Y. I am speaking  
16 tonight in support of RGGI. I am now and have been,  
17 for as long as I can remember, concerned about  
18 environmental issues and environmental protection.  
19 I am a lifelong resident of Pennsylvania, having  
20 been educated through high school in Pennsylvania  
21 and having returned to it after teaching a few years  
22 in the State of Connecticut.

23 I am, by all means, a senior citizen  
24 in my late 70s, but I do remember in my first year  
25 of teaching the title of a talk made by a fellow

1 faculty member, Robert Bag, of the biology  
2 department. He was urging his colleagues, that was  
3 us, to pay attention to what he called the three Ps,  
4 pollution, population and pesticides. These were,  
5 in his wise eyes, the threats we all had to address  
6 as educators and citizens, no matter what our  
7 discipline. That was 1966.

8           Since that time, we have had many  
9 environmental protection acts passed, starting  
10 usually at the national level and then proceeding to  
11 state legislation and finally to the construction of  
12 environmental regulations, often taking years to  
13 implement. Article 1, Section 27, of the  
14 Pennsylvania Constitution says, quote, the people  
15 have a right to clean air, pure water and to the  
16 preservation of the natural scenic, historic and  
17 aesthetic values of the environment.

18           Pennsylvania's public natural  
19 resources are the common property of all the people  
20 including generations yet to come, unquote. That  
21 concept was overwhelmingly approved by the voting  
22 population of Pennsylvanians in 1971. Joining the  
23 Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative would be a  
24 continuation of that effort. Pennsylvania has a  
25 legislative history of trying to protect

1 Pennsylvania's woods as our state lands were first  
2 known. We should do everything we can to keep our  
3 air and water clean as we move through the 21st  
4 Century.

5 Anything we can do in concert with  
6 other states in our region is doubly important. We  
7 are already seeing the impacts of climate change  
8 with milder winters, more rain and warmer summers.  
9 Future generations will have to live with and in the  
10 consequences of decisions made now.

11 Admittedly, as a small percentage of  
12 the world population, we cannot determine the big  
13 trends, the big picture that will play out on a  
14 global scale. But we can and must do everything  
15 possible to curtail emissions, especially when these  
16 actions are in sync with other states in our mid-  
17 Atlantic region. Thank you for giving me and other  
18 citizens the opportunity to speak in support of  
19 RGGI.

20 CHAIR: Thank you, Karen.

21 Next up, we have number 25, Shweta  
22 Arya. Do we have them on the line? Shweta, are you  
23 there?

24 MS. ARYA: Yes. I can hear you.

25 CHAIR: Oh, okay. All right.

1                   MS. ARYA: Good evening, everyone.  
2 Thanks so much for this opportunity - for giving me  
3 this opportunity to speak.

4                   My name is Shweta Arya, spell as S-H-  
5 W-E-T-A, last name is A-R-Y-A, Arya. And I am a  
6 resident of Garnet Valley, Pennsylvania. And I'm  
7 providing this testimony as a private citizen.

8                   I work as a director for a safe space  
9 environmental non-profit in Delaware. As a mother -  
10 as a mother of two children, who wants a healthy and  
11 sustainable future for her children, I ask you to  
12 take a bold and much needed action on climate by  
13 joining RGGI. Climate change is the biggest threat  
14 to public health. And by joining RGGI, we can do  
15 our part to cut the carbon emissions in PA. As a  
16 parent, I want my state to take this action to cut  
17 down the pollution in the air that we breathe every  
18 day.

19                   In Delaware County the air we breathe  
20 grades F according to the American Lung Association.  
21 Several Pennsylvania cities all place among the top  
22 25 most polluted cities in the U.S. Here in  
23 Pennsylvania we are already seeing the impacts of  
24 global warming, including the recent historic level  
25 flooding events. Delaware County is seeing some of

1 the worst flooding in years, and recently in August,  
2 we felt the impacts in our neighborhood where we'd  
3 never seen it for decades. Several towns were hit  
4 hard by tropical storm Isaiah in August.

5 RGGI is a big piece of the puzzle to  
6 help mitigate the effects of climate change. RGGI  
7 will help the environment, the economy and the  
8 health of Pennsylvanians. New Jersey is getting \$18  
9 million every year in RGGI money to invest in  
10 cleaner and healthier environment. And it will help  
11 the state with its economy and economic recovery  
12 from COVID.

13 We are in the midst of a raging  
14 pandemic, an economic recession, a crisis of  
15 structural racism and an escalating climate  
16 emergency. The best chance for making progress on  
17 any of these issues is to tackle them altogether.  
18 And with RGGI's funds, we can use that for green  
19 recovery. A well-designed recovery could lock in  
20 decades of low carbon emissions. It could reap the  
21 public health benefits that come along with  
22 replacing air polluting energy sources with clean  
23 energy generation. And it could steer benefits,  
24 like good jobs instead of gas being offshored, to  
25 the communities that have historically been left out

1 of economic opportunities.

2 Thank you so much. And I hope - I  
3 hope you will do the right thing by joining REGI.  
4 Thank you so much.

5 CHAIR: Thank you, Shweta. Next we  
6 have number 26, Hannah Smith-Brubaker. Hi, Hannah.

7 MS. SMITH-BRUBAKER: Hi.

8 My name is Hannah, H-A-N-N-A-H, Smith,  
9 S-M-I-T-H, hyphen, Brubaker, B-R-U-B-A-K-E-R.

10 A descendent of generations of  
11 steelworkers and coal miners in Allegheny County,  
12 today I farm with my family in rural Mifflin Town,  
13 Juniata County, on a 75-acre organic produce and  
14 livestock farm. I also lead PASA Sustainable  
15 Agriculture, a 7,500 member Pennsylvania based  
16 farming organization inside of a network of close to  
17 60,000 farmers and supporters, focusing on  
18 sustainable agriculture education, research and  
19 apprenticeships.

20 Thank you for the opportunity to  
21 testify on behalf of farmers who know that  
22 ecologically minded farming is vital to ensuring a  
23 future where we can feed people food grown in the  
24 soil, the source of our food's nutrients. My own  
25 farm's mission is to connect people to their food,

1 the earth and each other. And we are proud to be  
2 farming ecologically while providing good jobs for  
3 our employees, a good quality of life for our family  
4 and nutritious food for our customers.

5 With the recent approval by the  
6 Attorney General of Governor Wolf's executive order  
7 charging DEP to promulgate a CO2 budget trading  
8 program aligned with the Regional Greenhouse Gas  
9 Initiative, we are poised to take a significant step  
10 forward for Pennsylvania meeting its carbon emission  
11 reduction goals by 2025 and 2050.

12 PASA particularly supports the three  
13 offset categories listed in the draft chapter 145,  
14 preliminary regulations, landfill methane reduction,  
15 tree planting, forest management and avoided forest  
16 conversion and agricultural methane reduction. We  
17 also believe that agricultural offsets should be  
18 expanded to include additional cost effective  
19 agricultural practices that reduce CO2 emissions and  
20 sequester carbon.

21 Nationwide agricultural production is  
22 responsible for almost ten percent of total U.S.  
23 emissions. The recent surge in activity across  
24 states to promote and fund soil health practices is  
25 a response to soil loss and soil productivity loss.



1 Farms employing healthy soil practices are seeing  
2 soil carbon levels increase from a baseline of one  
3 to two percent soil carbon to five to eight percent  
4 soil carbon over a period of ten or more years which  
5 adds up to 25 to 60 tons of additional carbon per  
6 acre.

7 Many states are passing soil health  
8 legislation to incentivize farmers to adopt more  
9 practices more quickly to address climate change.  
10 Pennsylvania partners including PASA are working on  
11 a soil health roadmap to outline the best way to  
12 fund and promote healthy soil practices in  
13 Pennsylvania.

14 A CO2 budget trading program under the  
15 auspices of the RGGI would be an ideal and logical  
16 place to incorporate and help fund practices that  
17 improve soils and retain more soil carbon, like no  
18 till cover crops and rotational grazing. One need  
19 only look to our neighbors to the north at Cornell  
20 University to access a fantastic carbon farming  
21 report. And I've included a link to that report in  
22 my written testimony.

23 Farms can be a larger part of the  
24 greenhouse gas solution if given more incentives,  
25 technical support and funding. Integrating agri-

1 forestry, planting more trees, buffers and cover  
2 crops on farms will sequester more carbon in farm  
3 soils. These practices also keep soil and nutrients  
4 out of our streams and reduce property and crop  
5 damage from flooding and drought. Farms are a great  
6 investment in carbon offset.

7                   Since carbon dioxide - excuse me,  
8 since CO2 trading proceeds are invested in energy  
9 efficiency, renewable energy and other consumer  
10 benefits programs, farms stand to have the co-  
11 benefit of green infrastructure that improves their  
12 bottom line. Fortunately, agriculture provides a  
13 diverse menu of options for investments, like  
14 renewable energy deployment, soil carbon storage,  
15 plant carbon storage, fleet and equipment  
16 electrification and building energy efficiency.

17                   Agriculture is uniquely positioned to  
18 utilize funds from the RGGI to increase carbon  
19 capture, increase renewable energy and increase  
20 efficiency. All this is to say RGGI itself may only  
21 be the first step in the direction that we must head  
22 to ensure a secure food system, but it is a great  
23 option and we have to get started. Thank you.

24                   CHAIR: Thank you, Hannah.

25                   Next - well, number 27 notified us

1 that they no longer wished to testify. Do we have  
2 number 29, Ruth Sikes on the line?

3 MR. JAGIELA: I do not see her on the  
4 line right now.

5 CHAIR: Okay.

6 So then how about number 30, Kelsey  
7 Salerno? Sorry about that.

8 MS. SALERNO: That's okay. Can you  
9 hear me okay?

10 CHAIR: Yep.

11 We can hear you great.

12 MS. SALERNO: Hi.

13 My name is Kelsey Salerno. It's  
14 S-A-L-E-R-N-O. And I am a lifelong Pittsburgher and  
15 a union leader from the Mon Valley region. I'm here  
16 today in support of the proposed RGGI rulemaking and  
17 to advocate that the board finalizes this rulemaking  
18 as soon as possible, with some slight modifications.

19 So we know that the story of our  
20 Commonwealth is one of infamy as a significant  
21 emitter of carbon, disrupting pollution on a global  
22 scale. We've ranked second in the nation of fracked  
23 gas production and third in coal production,  
24 emitting one percent of carbon pollution, which is  
25 more CO2 than 172 of the 194 signatories to the

1 Paris Climate Agreement.

2           We know that this pollution is  
3 disproportionately impacting the most vulnerable of  
4 our neighbors, who will continue to shoulder the  
5 greatest burden from this pollution. And this isn't  
6 just those in urban areas, but it's also folks out  
7 in our rural areas, elderly, poor and low income  
8 residents.

9           We can't hope to tackle pollution and  
10 climate change without also addressing environmental  
11 racism, that we know most significantly impacts  
12 black communities, but also our indigenous and other  
13 communities of color. And it's high time that the  
14 real cost of pollution falls on those industries  
15 that directly contribute to environmental injustice,  
16 instead of those Pennsylvanians who are forced to  
17 live with the daily impacts of pollution while  
18 having their tax dollars continue to subsidize dirty  
19 industries.

20           So I don't delude myself into  
21 believing that these market-based solutions like  
22 RGGI will solve climate change or fix systemic  
23 issues that have resulted from capitalism and white  
24 supremacy. But adopting this regulation provides  
25 one tangible pathway for reducing the dangerous

1 greenhouse gases that impact not only fellow  
2 Pennsylvanians, but also those across the globe.

3           Adopting this regulation will have a  
4 positive ripple effect that will go beyond reducing  
5 emissions, something that we've actually witnessed  
6 with other RGGI states. For example, from 2008 to  
7 2016, we saw that New York received almost a billion  
8 dollars in the RGGI auction proceeds. And that  
9 those proceeds were then reinvested in efforts to  
10 improve residential energy efficiency, reducing, you  
11 know, greenhouse gas emissions, promoting renewable  
12 energy projects and assisting low income consumers  
13 in paying their electricity bills, while also  
14 training workers in green collar careers.

15           New York and other states have been at  
16 this for over a decade. And it's about time that  
17 Pennsylvania gets on board quick and in a hurry. We  
18 know that fossil fuels are a finite resource that  
19 are a result of a unique billion years long  
20 geological formation that will never, ever again  
21 occur in the next billion years that the earth is  
22 still around. So we must pivot now from this  
23 pathway of extraction and exploitation of our  
24 resources and our communities and begin investing in  
25 clean energy solutions that benefit all of us, not

1 just those that can afford it, with an urgency that  
2 matches the scale of the problem.

3                   There is a wise Chinese proverb. The  
4 best time to plant a tree is 20 years ago. The  
5 second best time is today. Pennsylvania can  
6 continue to keep hitting the snooze button on  
7 climate change alarm or we can choose to wake up,  
8 hop up out of bed and actually seize the day to  
9 tackle climate change and invest in our communities.  
10 It is high time that those who have been charged  
11 with ensuring the health of all Pennsylvanians take  
12 a proactive approach in dealing with the legacy  
13 pollution that has plagued our Commonwealth and pass  
14 this rulemaking to cut down on pollution from our  
15 power sector.

16                   I would urge the EQB to finalize the  
17 rulemaking ASAP, with two minor modifications. The  
18 first, there should be - the DEP should create a  
19 monitoring program that measures other co-pollutants  
20 that the power sector admits directly, that impacts  
21 our environmental justice communities. If elevated  
22 pollutant levels are detected to those pre-RGGI  
23 baselines, then the DEP should swiftly step in and  
24 engage residents to identify co-developed community  
25 based solutions.

1                   Second, the start line for the cap  
2 should not exceed the emissions in the year before  
3 the program was implemented. If it happens to be  
4 the case that the pre-RGGI emissions drop sooner  
5 than anticipated, then initial cap should be  
6 lowered. So what does all this jargon mean for  
7 families like me? In mine, I know for me it costs  
8 over \$400 a lot of months to heat my home in the  
9 winter. And investing in our communities through  
10 these RGGI allowances would help benefit families  
11 like mine. All right. Thank you.

12                   CHAIR: Thank you, Kelsey.

13                   Next up we have number 31, Maureen  
14 Mulligan. Maureen, are you with us?

15                   MS. MULLIGAN: I am.

16                   CHAIR: Hi, Maureen.

17                   MS. MULLIGAN: Hi.

18                   My name is Maureen Mulligan,  
19 M-A-U-R-E-E-N, M-U-L-L-I-G-A-N. I live in Lebanon,  
20 Pennsylvania. And I am owner of Sustainable Futures  
21 Communications. Our consulting firm is made up of  
22 my husband and myself, and we have 70 years of  
23 combined energy industry experience, focused on  
24 renewable energy, energy efficiency, wholesale  
25 electricity markets and grid reliability.

1           I hope Pennsylvania is in the final  
2 stages to become the 11th state to join the Regional  
3 Greenhouse Gas Initiative. Then Pennsylvania can  
4 systematically work toward the goal of reducing  
5 greenhouse gases by 26 percent by 2025, from the  
6 2005 limits and 80 percent by 2050.

7           Some emissions deductions will come  
8 easily through coal plant retirements, particularly  
9 in light of the Talen Energy's recent announcement  
10 to cease coal operations by 2025. I would like to  
11 share how I see Pennsylvania's renewable energy and  
12 energy efficiency potentials steadily expand over  
13 almost 20 years of my direct involvement.

14           Participating in RGGI opens a real  
15 opportunity for a reliable and affordable clean  
16 energy future. I hope you will take the action  
17 needed to move the Commonwealth forward.

18           I became directly involved in  
19 renewable energy, in particular solar energy and  
20 energy efficiency, beginning in 2002 when I formed  
21 my government relations and consulting business  
22 after 14 years of working at the Public Utility  
23 Commission. When I was working at the PUC, there  
24 was virtually no solar photovoltaics on the grid in  
25 Pennsylvania. In fact, only a handful of under ten



1 KW home solar PV systems were installed at the time.  
2 And those systems were primarily funded through the  
3 Sustainable Energy Fund PV Grant Program post  
4 restructuring of the electricity industry.

5           In 2004, Pennsylvania passed the AEPS,  
6 the Alternative Energy Portfolio Standard, Act 213,  
7 with a half a percent solar goal for the state's  
8 electrical utilities to meet by '21, 2021. I was  
9 intimately involved at the time of the passage as I  
10 represented the two major solar trade associations  
11 working towards its passage.

12           Subsequent legislation funded many  
13 solar energy and efficiency projects. Now, almost  
14 17 years later, the solar industry has matured  
15 beyond recognition, with an experience to delivery  
16 gigawatts, not kilowatts to the grid. At the time  
17 of the passage of Act 213, many outside the industry  
18 questioned whether solar could meet even the  
19 smallest obligation. This skepticism was reflected  
20 in the presence of statutory language, providing an  
21 out for utilities that could legitimately not  
22 fulfill the solar requirement.

23           At that time, the solar industry  
24 assured policymakers that the industry could deliver  
25 a trained workforce, innovate, a lower cost and was

1 ready. Today, excluding rooftop solar systems,  
2 Pennsylvania's solar accounts for at least 317  
3 megawatts of capacity. Solar is more than ready to  
4 provide a significant share of Pennsylvania's  
5 electricity needs. As solar-plus storage sees  
6 massive expansion, it will deliver a cost lower than  
7 the nuclear power. In the near future these costs  
8 will also be at parity with natural gas, which is  
9 far from a clean energy source.

10 To frame the feasibility of moving  
11 solar future into our core plans, I urge you to  
12 focus on the DEP's Pennsylvania solar future plan of  
13 2019 that engaged more than 500 stakeholders over a  
14 two-and-a-half-year process, outlining pathways to  
15 achieve ten percent solar. I served as one of the  
16 consultant facilitators on that project. I hope you  
17 will draw on this valuable resource when examining  
18 the most cost effective policies and approaches to  
19 deploying solar and to reduce carbon.

20 One of the 15 recommendation  
21 strategies was to set a price on carbon. And - and  
22 that's - I am looking at the time, and I have quite  
23 a bit here. So I will just add some of that. The  
24 ten percent solar would reduce emissions by 9.3  
25 percent and reduce total greenhouse gases by 2 and 3

1 percent. And I am going to skip a little bit here  
2 and talk about the role of energy efficiency, which  
3 I was involved in for many years.

4 Our model at Keystone Energy  
5 Efficiency Alliance was the cheapest form of energy  
6 is energy saved. And then finally, I want to say  
7 that nuclear power is not a clean energy source.  
8 Trading one dirty source of energy for another is  
9 not sound policy. Even though it's fair to say it's  
10 carbon free, we are living with the results of a  
11 dirty energy system for a long time. In fact, in  
12 central Pennsylvania, TMI will take at least 60  
13 years to clean up.

14 I have a little more to say, and I'll  
15 put them in my final comments.

16 CHAIR: Sounds good. If you could  
17 mail them to reg comments at PA.gov, we'll make sure  
18 that we get everything that you wanted to say.

19 MS. MULLIGAN: Yep. Thank you.

20 CHAIR: Thank you very much. Next up,  
21 we have number 32, Marcia Rapone. Do we have Marcia  
22 on the line?

23 MS. RAPONE: Yes. It's Marcia. Thank  
24 you.

25 CHAIR: Got it right the first time.

1 All right. Marcia, go ahead.

2 MS. RAPONE: Thank you so much for  
3 allowing me the opportunity to testify in  
4 enthusiastic support of Pennsylvania joining the  
5 Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative, commonly  
6 referred to as RGGI. My name is Marcia Rapone.  
7 It's M-A-R-C-I-A, Rapone, R-A, P as in Paul, O-N-E.

8 And I am testifying today as a private  
9 citizen of West Grove, Pennsylvania, which is a  
10 rural town in southern Chester County. I, like many  
11 others here tonight, am concerned about climate  
12 change.

13 I've adapted the little strategies in  
14 my day-to-day life to try to reduce my carbon  
15 footprint. You know, I bring my bags to the  
16 grocery. I bought the most fuel efficient vehicle I  
17 could afford. I've insulated my hot water heater.  
18 I've installed new, more energy efficient windows in  
19 my home. I've tried to be conscious of where my  
20 food comes from and how it's produced. I'm saving  
21 for solar panels for my south facing home. And I  
22 have chosen renewable energy to power my house from  
23 PECO.

24 But all of these things, and the  
25 myriad of other little, small things that I try to

1 make part of my habit in my life, they are still  
2 like not enough. I do not have the buying power,  
3 nor the clout, to drive systemic market change, but  
4 you do.

5 I'd like to tell you a story about a  
6 group of federal purchasing agents that I had the  
7 opportunity to work with many years ago. They  
8 purchased goods and services related to feeding,  
9 clothing and arming America's fighting forces. From  
10 on the ground intel in the field, they learned that  
11 plastics, especially those plastic water bottles,  
12 were not able to be disposed of properly. How could  
13 they - or what could they do about this? They were  
14 thousands of miles away in another country.

15 Well, these purchasing agents  
16 partnered with industry and eventually over a long  
17 almost ten-year period of study, they developed a  
18 bio-based plastic solution. This new material  
19 passed rigorous evaluations needed to ensure it  
20 would meet the needs of our boots on the ground.  
21 And the research was cutting edge at the time. So  
22 this was back in the early 2000s. It took vision  
23 and a dedicated champion. It was hard, a lot of  
24 patience was required. But they persevered. And I  
25 believe the vision of these purchasing agents

1 promoted the - this vision that they promoted ended  
2 up shifting the marketplace.

3                   Bio-based plastics and packaging now  
4 is commonplace. I'm not saying that this solved all  
5 the world's problems with plastic. We all know  
6 that's not true. But I am - I am saying that we  
7 have opportunity to do better. It was a courageous  
8 first step. It was championed by brave individuals,  
9 who were trying to make a change for the better.  
10 You have the same kind of opportunity in front of  
11 you.

12                   You are courageous individuals,  
13 proposing a rule that has the ability to drive  
14 market change here in Pennsylvania. I am grateful  
15 to you for your dedication. I know that this path  
16 has been hard. And that listening to hours and  
17 hours of testimony, reviewing pages and pages of  
18 facts and figures and working in this politically  
19 charged environment has been a challenge. Thank you  
20 for persevering.

21                   Bipartisan leadership in the  
22 Commonwealth has set the stage for this moment. Our  
23 representatives and senators passed the Climate  
24 Change Act of 2008. The DEP has quantified the main  
25 source of greenhouse gas emissions in our state is

1 coming from industry, electricity generation and  
2 transportation, in that order. Twenty-nine (29)  
3 percent of our greenhouse gas emissions come from  
4 electricity generation.

5 RGGI is our opportunity to drive that  
6 number down. RGGI is by no means perfect. And it  
7 is by no means the only answer. But it is an  
8 opportunity for Pennsylvania leadership to  
9 demonstrate their commitment to actually mitigating  
10 the impacts of climate change on the residents of  
11 Pennsylvania. I enthusiastically support  
12 Pennsylvania joining the Regional Greenhouse Gas  
13 Initiative. Thank you so much for allowing me to  
14 testify tonight.

15 CHAIR: Thank you, Marcia. Next, we  
16 have number 33, Chris Horwitz. Do we have Chris on  
17 the line?

18 MR. HORWITZ: Yes, hello. Can you  
19 hear me?

20 CHAIR: Hi, yes. We can hear you,  
21 Chris.

22 MR. HORWITZ: Well, I thank you for  
23 letting me testify. It's C-H-R-I-S and then  
24 H-O-W-I-T-Z. Now, about 30 - more than 30 years ago  
25 I moved to Pennsylvania from Australia. I had read

1 and talked with people who said to me that  
2 Pittsburgh was a dynamic, growing community that was  
3 a great one to have high tech move into it and all  
4 of the university environment was great.

5           So I moved to Pittsburgh and I setup a  
6 company to make equipment for the semiconductor  
7 industry. So it's a rather high tech industry that  
8 I brought into Pittsburgh, so I'm proud of that.  
9 And when I came here, the EPA had issued its new  
10 source regulations, specifying that the dirty power  
11 plants in the Pittsburgh area would soon have to  
12 clean their act up.

13           However, I didn't count on the effect  
14 of corruption in our body politics here that would  
15 have allowed the new source regulations to be  
16 ignored for the past 30 years and for these plants  
17 to keep emitting long past the time when they should  
18 have been cleaned up. And another speaker talked  
19 about the Reliant Energy plant as being one of the  
20 really nasty ones that still is running.

21           I have been waiting impatiently, thus,  
22 for proper moves on clean energy, clean air and  
23 climate change action for quite a while. Now it  
24 seems at last that we can make some progress. And  
25 my thanks to Governor Wolf and the DEP for pushing



1 this forward. I want to see this program  
2 implemented. It's clearly been beneficial to the  
3 other ten northeastern states.

4 We need to take this climate action.  
5 The sooner we take these actions, the sooner we'll  
6 have a slightly more stable means of continuing our  
7 lives. The longer we delay the more hurtful and  
8 damaging the effects will be on our future lives.  
9 And also, I am hopefully that at long last this will  
10 cause the EPA's new source regulations to finally  
11 take effect and make our air cleaner. So when I'm  
12 walking in the environment, I don't feel that I'm  
13 increasing my lifespan with the exercise, but  
14 similarly decreasing it by every breath that I take.

15 So it's time to stop hiding from the  
16 facts, time to stop taking money from fossil fuels  
17 to corrupt our public policy, time to stop  
18 investment in what are soon to be stranded assets  
19 and its time to make strong moves to guarantee us  
20 all a better future. Thank you.

21 CHAIR: Thank you, Chris. Next up, we  
22 have number 34, Leann Leiter. Leann, are you on?  
23 Hello?

24 MS. LEITER: Can you hear me all  
25 right?

1                    CHAIR: Yes, we can hear you.

2                    MS. LEITER: Great. Thank you so  
3 much. Yes, my name is Leann Leiter, spelled  
4 L-E-A-N-N, L-E-I-T-E-R. And I am speaking from  
5 Canonsburg, Pennsylvania, in Washington County. So  
6 it's a little bit south of the speaker immediately  
7 prior.

8                    And it's really my pleasure tonight to  
9 congratulate the DEP on helping make Pennsylvania a  
10 part of the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative.  
11 Thank you all so much for your time and your  
12 consideration of public input, both tonight and in  
13 the coming days, on making RGGI as effective as  
14 possible for Pennsylvania.

15                    I am speaking today as a proud, nearly  
16 lifelong resident of the state. As an avid fly  
17 angler and backpacker, I am proud of our gorgeous  
18 woodlands. But like so many people in our state,  
19 and probably many listening tonight, I've lived  
20 through a bout with Lyme disease, which  
21 Pennsylvania's outdoors has sadly become known for.  
22 Global warming increases the prevalence of this  
23 terrible disease.

24                    As I mentioned, I live in southwestern  
25 Pennsylvania, where our rural areas are also

1 becoming associated with the health threat of air  
2 pollution, and in south Pittsburgh, which is  
3 becoming known for its pollution almost more than  
4 its pierogis. So it's a little bit funny. But in  
5 truth, the metropolitan area of Pittsburgh has been  
6 ranked number eight for annual particle pollution by  
7 the American Lung Association. So our pollution  
8 problem is - it's pretty serious here.

9                   Fortunately, RGGI will help tackle  
10 some of the pollution that is specific to power  
11 plants in Pennsylvania. Estimates show us that RGGI  
12 can give us better air, in fact, 180 million tons of  
13 carbon better. And it will reduce the health  
14 harming co-pollutants that come with that carbon.  
15 We know already from watching what's happened in  
16 other states that are taking part in RGGI means  
17 signing up for healthier kids and adults, with fewer  
18 asthma attacks.

19                   If we do it right, this truly can be a  
20 step towards environmental justice. Because  
21 operators tend to build power plants like other  
22 polluting industries in the midst of communities of  
23 color. Higher asthma rates among people of color is  
24 just proof of that despicable legacy. But RGGI is  
25 also a step towards righting the global injustices

1 of climate change, as other speakers have mentioned,  
2 where the most vulnerable people are often taking  
3 the brunt of rising sea levels, food made  
4 unaffordable due to crop loss and the explosion of  
5 yet more diseases spurred on by climate change.

6           Now, if anybody was to object to the  
7 idea of putting a price on pollution, don't worry,  
8 because we actually already do. Everyone in  
9 Pennsylvania pays some of the price, except for the  
10 businesses creating it. All of us with lungs here  
11 are filtering out the air right now, every breath  
12 we're taking. And everyone around the world stands  
13 at the mercy of our state's outside contributions to  
14 the climate crisis.

15           And I think I heard someone mention  
16 earlier that Pennsylvania is, in fact, the third  
17 largest greenhouse gas polluter in the U.S. So this  
18 cap-and-invest program should be used to simply put  
19 the cost where it belongs and put the proceeds to a  
20 fitting use, reducing pollution and making  
21 Pennsylvania and the world safer for all of us.  
22 Without a doubt, we have the responsibility to do  
23 far more. And we cannot rest here. But RGGI is an  
24 important step that we must take to protect people  
25 and the planet.

1                   Now, to get this right, I urge the DEP  
2 to start by fully gaming out this plan on the  
3 ground, or more accurately in the air, and to finish  
4 with a program that ensures no Pennsylvanians end up  
5 with localized increases to the pollution in their  
6 communities. We absolutely have to ensure that RGGI  
7 means that those of us living with pollution get to  
8 breathe better air. And we must ensure that the  
9 program is enacted in such a way as to not increase  
10 costs on those already living under heavy energy  
11 cost burdens.

12                   Now, I'm extremely excited for the  
13 next RGGI conversation with the department and hope  
14 that the Department will then boldly invest RGGI's  
15 revenues directly into the populations most in  
16 harm's way. That money should mean local  
17 investments in people and places. The investments  
18 should simultaneously help us transition away from  
19 dirty power generation, but also let Pennsylvania  
20 lead. Let us lead into using less power in the  
21 first place. It only makes sense to invest RGGI  
22 proceeds in energy efficiency, especially for our  
23 low income households.

24                   Investments in energy efficiency can  
25 make indoor environments and the climate more

1 livable. And these are also investments in much  
2 needed jobs that are local jobs, most importantly.  
3 And we truly need both jobs and healthy and  
4 efficient spaces to live and work now more than  
5 ever. Thank you very much for the time to address  
6 the Department this evening.

7 CHAIR: Thank you, Leann. Next, we  
8 have number 35, Emily Schapira. Emily, are you on?

9 MS. SCHAPIRA: I'm on. Can you hear  
10 me?

11 CHAIR: We can hear you.

12 MS. SCHAPIRA: All right. Great.

13 Hi, my name is Emily Schapira. It's  
14 S-C-H-A-P-I-R-A. I am the CEO of the Philadelphia  
15 Energy Authority. Thanks for having me here today  
16 to share some brief testimony in enthusiastic  
17 support of RGGI. The Philadelphia Energy Authority  
18 is an independent municipal authority focused on  
19 energy affordability and sustainability for  
20 Philadelphia.

21 In 2016, we launched the Philadelphia  
22 Energy Campaign. It is a ten-year \$1 billion  
23 investment in energy efficiency and clean energy  
24 projects in order to create 10,000 jobs. In its  
25 first three years the campaign helped launch over

1 \$136 million in projects and created over 1,300  
2 jobs. We started Pennsylvania's first high school  
3 vocational training program in solar and  
4 weatherization, now available to all school  
5 districts across the Commonwealth.

6                   We've launched Pennsylvania's first C-  
7 PACE program, which provides long-term financing to  
8 commercial clean energy projects and have completed  
9 \$8 million so far in projects. We've supported over  
10 700 residential solar projects through Solarized  
11 Philly. And we've served over 90,000 Philadelphia  
12 households through our water and sewer service line  
13 protection program.

14                   We're in the process of building what  
15 will hopefully briefly be Pennsylvania's largest  
16 solar array, an 80 megawatt project in Adams County,  
17 to power 22 percent of the city's electricity usage.  
18 I share these accomplishments for this reason.

19                   Philadelphia has been successful  
20 recently in doing a lot with a little. RGGI  
21 presents an opportunity to do more with more. We  
22 started our initiative with a very modest annual  
23 budget from the city. We've developed programs and  
24 projects that leverage existing government, utility  
25 and nonprofit resources and that enhance the

1 capabilities of the private sector to drive a robust  
2 and equitable clean energy market here.

3 RGGI will generate revenue that can be  
4 targeted towards our state's biggest challenges,  
5 particularly those that won't be possible to  
6 substantively tackle without subsidy. Those who  
7 need the subsidy most are the very same folks who  
8 have and will continue to bear the brunt of the  
9 harshest effects of climate change and environmental  
10 damage, brought in large part by our long subsidized  
11 reliance on fossil fuels.

12 Philadelphia has one of the highest  
13 rates of childhood asthma in the nation and serious  
14 flooding during extreme weather events. Low wealth  
15 communities, primarily minority majority  
16 communities, due to a difficult history of red  
17 lining and system racism are affected most. In our  
18 city, over half of all minority households and over  
19 40 percent of all renters at any income level before  
20 COVID face energy insecurity each year. And that's  
21 only been exacerbated by the pandemic.

22 Fewer than 30 percent of low income  
23 homes in our utility service territory who are  
24 eligible for subsidized rates actually receive them.  
25 And Act 29 puts a very, very small dent in energy



1 burdens of low income households. A PECO executive  
2 once shared with me that they find themselves  
3 frequently entering a home, looking around and  
4 seeing a hole in the roof or other structural or  
5 systemic issues, and then changing the light bulbs  
6 and leaving.

7                   These are not small problems. These  
8 are symptoms of entrenched systemic poverty,  
9 generations of low income home ownership and aging  
10 housing stock, of decades of implementing energy  
11 efficiency or home repair programs that do more to  
12 maintain poverty than to reduce it. Energy is a  
13 critical access point to some of our biggest  
14 challenges in Philadelphia. And these are expensive  
15 problems to solve.

16                   Revenue generated from RGGI, which is  
17 intended in some small part to finally reflect the  
18 societal cost of absorbing the effects of CO2  
19 pollution, has the ability to put substantive  
20 recurring dollars into innovative programs that  
21 fundamentally solve problems. Our top priorities in  
22 Philadelphia for RGGI funding are twofold.

23                   First, for our built to last low  
24 income housing restoration program, which  
25 fundamentally preserves existing single family

1 affordable housing, and make sure it's safe, healthy  
2 and affordable for the long term. Built to last  
3 leverages electrification and solar to reduce the  
4 energy burden and displacement from gentrification  
5 for these families. And second, grants and loans  
6 that we can use at our soon to be launched  
7 Philadelphia Green Bank to provide credit  
8 enhancements and renew equitable green capital to  
9 Philadelphia to get more clean energy work done.

10           Before I end, and I know I have 30  
11 seconds, I just want to note, one other factor for  
12 your consideration in rulemaking. Philly's home to  
13 the second largest district energy system in the  
14 country. It's owned by Vicinity Energy. It  
15 provides steam to over 96 million square feet of  
16 commercial and industrial buildings.

17           And I just want to make sure that -  
18 because this is sort of a unique facility in  
19 Pennsylvania and around the country, it's actually  
20 unique everywhere, we hope that EQB will ensure that  
21 this plant and other district energy systems are  
22 considered appropriately to properly incentivize low  
23 carbon power generation. Thanks so much.

24           CHAIR: Thank you, Emily. Next, we  
25 have number 36, Matt Mehalik.

1                   MR. MEHALIK: Hi, there. Matt Mehalik  
2 here.

3                   CHAIR: Hi, Matt.

4                   MR. MEHALIK: Hi.

5                   Matthew Mehalik, M-A-T-T-H-E-W,  
6 Mehalik, M-E-H-A-L-I-K. I am with the Breathe  
7 Project, B-R-E-A-T-H-E, in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania  
8 on Bedford Avenue. Thank you very much for holding  
9 this hearing. I appreciate the opportunity to  
10 comment on the proposed rule involving the  
11 Commonwealth's participation in the Regional  
12 Greenhouse Gas Initiative.

13                   The Breathe Project's a southwestern  
14 Pennsylvania organization that avails itself of top  
15 level health, epidemiological and air quality  
16 science and public health information. We are a  
17 collaboration of over 42 organizations, working to  
18 improve air quality, eliminate climate pollution and  
19 make our region a healthy and prosperous place to  
20 live.

21                   The Breathe Project supports the  
22 Commonwealth's participation in RGGI because of the  
23 program's health, climate and economic benefits.  
24 The RGGI program will reduce climate and air  
25 pollution. It will improve the health of

1 southwestern Pennsylvania's 2.6 million residents.  
2 It will reduce nitrogen oxide, sulfur dioxide and  
3 particulates resulting in fewer cases of respiratory  
4 diseases and deaths and has been documented - as has  
5 been documented with past experiences with the  
6 program.

7                   Our region suffers from some of the  
8 worst air pollution in the U.S. According to  
9 analysis of our region's pollution sources from the  
10 National Emissions Inventory, particle pollution  
11 from stationary industrial points sources, including  
12 power plants, facilities that will be addressed by  
13 the RGGI program, is the largest contributor to our  
14 region's pollution, accounting for approximately two  
15 thirds of our region's pollution.

16                   Air quality ranks not good two thirds  
17 of all days in our region from the EPA air quality  
18 index ratings for at least the past five years. An  
19 analysis of data from one of our region's monitors  
20 in Allegheny County, the Liberty Monitor, has  
21 measurements that rank worse than 97 percent of data  
22 from all 774 monitors throughout the United States  
23 and currently exceeds the standard.

24                   Data from two other nearby monitors in  
25 Braddock and Parkway exceed the World Health

1 standards and rank worse than 93 percent of all  
2 monitors in the United States. Across Allegheny  
3 County, data from seven out of out eight monitors  
4 have been in the worst 30 percent of all monitors  
5 nationally, with our best monitor ranking at the  
6 40th percentile nationally. On average our region's  
7 air ranks at the bottom 11 and a half percentile  
8 when compared with monitored regions across the  
9 United States.

10 Allegheny County also ranks in the top  
11 two percent of counties in the United States for  
12 cancer risks for point source air pollution. Our  
13 air poses a significant threat to public health with  
14 an increased risk for - of heart disease, lung  
15 disease, asthma, diabetes, cancer and premature  
16 death.

17 A recent study of 1,200 children in  
18 schools in proximity to point source pollution  
19 sources in Allegheny County, 70 percent were exposed  
20 to two and a half - were exposed to 2.5 fine  
21 particle pollution at an annual mean level greater  
22 than 10 microgram per cubic meter, which is the  
23 World Health Organization's recommended upper limit.  
24 This compares with a 3.1 percent rate of exposure  
25 nationally at the same level. This rate of exposure

1 is alarmingly high.

2                   Additionally, children exposed to  
3 pollution levels above this level increase their  
4 odds of having asthma by 58 percent as compared with  
5 children exposed to pollution below this limit. Of  
6 this same sample, 39 percent of the participating  
7 children were exposed to levels higher than 12  
8 micrograms per cubic meter, which is the U.S. EPA's  
9 compliance limit as prescribed by the Clean Air Act.

10                   Many of the children live in  
11 environmental justice communities, with a high  
12 percentage of low income and African American  
13 families. The overall prevalence of asthma in the  
14 study was highest among African Americans at 27  
15 percent and those 10 to 12 years of age on public  
16 health insurance. A review of literature affirms PM  
17 2.5 exposure levels at chronic health affect with no  
18 apparent lower bound and acute health affects with  
19 no apparent lower bound. This means we need to  
20 reduce this pollution.

21                   Our state clearly needs to join RGGI  
22 because of the health benefits of reducing  
23 pollution. The Breathe Project encourages  
24 Pennsylvania to move forward aggressively to reduce  
25 climate and air pollution with RGGI. Let's save

1 lives, reduce burdens on vulnerable people, preserve  
2 future generation's rights to clean air and a  
3 healthy climate and take action that makes everyone  
4 proud.

5 We can do all of this while growing  
6 Pennsylvania's economy and jobs with RGGI. The path  
7 to future prosperity can begin with RGGI. Thank you  
8 very much for your time and consideration.

9 CHAIR: Thank you, Matthew. Next, we  
10 have Betsy DeLuca. Do we have Betsy on the line?

11 MR. JAGIELA: I do not see Betsy on  
12 the line.

13 CHAIR: Okay.

14 And then we'll go to number 38. Mitch  
15 Karaica.

16 MR. KARAICA: Yes, I'm here. My name  
17 is Mitch Karaica, M-I-T-C-H, K-A-R-A-I-C-A. And I  
18 am speaking tonight from IBW Local 29 and also as a  
19 Springdale Borough resident.

20 Good evening. Once again, my name is  
21 Mitch Karaica. And I have been a proud member of  
22 the IBW and an employee at Cheswick Generating  
23 Station for 22 years. I am also a lifelong resident  
24 of the Cheswick Springdale area. I am speaking to  
25 you tonight in opposition to Governor Wolf's

1 proposed regulation of the CO2 budget trading  
2 program, which will join Pennsylvania into the  
3 Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative.

4 I urge the Independent Regulatory  
5 Reform Commission to reject Governor Wolf's proposed  
6 RGGI tax. The Pennsylvania House voted 130 to 71 in  
7 favor of House Bill 2025, and the senate voted 33 to  
8 17 in favor of the bill also. This bill would put  
9 the decision to join RGGI into the hands of the  
10 Pennsylvania General Assembly, where it should be.  
11 Unfortunately, Governor Wolf vetoed this bill,  
12 despite overwhelming support from the legislature.

13 Pennsylvania has the largest full-time  
14 legislature in the nation at 253 members that are  
15 elected by their constituents. Yet, we have a  
16 Governor that is ignoring not only the legislature,  
17 but the residents of Pennsylvania, whose voices are  
18 being ignored. The adoption of RGGI will result in  
19 the loss of over 8,000 jobs, the loss of \$2.87  
20 billion in total economic impact, the loss of \$539  
21 million in employee compensation and the loss of  
22 \$34.2 million in state and local taxes.

23 As a resident of Springdale, this will  
24 affect my family and my community much more than  
25 most of the people that have been speaking at these



1 hearings. I will not only lose my job of 22 years,  
2 but my school and property taxes will increase for  
3 not only me, but the whole community. This comes  
4 just as we are finding out that our sewage rates are  
5 doubling due to another unfunded mandate by the  
6 Pennsylvania DEP. Small businesses will close, our  
7 small community will begin to shutter, as so many  
8 before it have.

9           The Governor and the environmental  
10 groups will claim victory and move onto their next  
11 victim, while the residents of Springdale are left  
12 to pick up the pieces, without revenue from its two  
13 power plants that anchored our community for  
14 decades. I ask - I ask you, is the destruction of  
15 these families and communities worth the benefits?  
16 The Governor's own modeling confirms that most of  
17 the carbon dioxide reductions from plant closures  
18 will shift to non-RGGI states like Ohio and West  
19 Virginia.

20           Those states will take our 8,000 jobs  
21 and tax revenues. As a result, carbon dioxide  
22 emissions will increase across our border and in our  
23 region, which will more than offset any carbon  
24 dioxide reductions in Pennsylvania. RGGI makes no  
25 sense for a state like Pennsylvania, which possesses

1 an abundance of coal and natural gas resources and  
2 as a result, has the most reliable, affordable and  
3 resilient portfolio of electric generation in the  
4 country.

5                   Once again, I urge the Independent  
6 Regulatory Reform Commission and Governor Wolf to  
7 reject the proposed RGGI tax. Thank you.

8                   CHAIR: Thank you, Mitch. Next, we  
9 have number 39, Gene Webber. Do we have Gene on the  
10 line?

11                   MR. JAGIELA: I do not see Gene on the  
12 line.

13                   CHAIR: Okay.

14                   How about number 40, Robert Little?  
15 Do we have Robert?

16                   MR. LITTLE: Can you hear me now?

17                   CHAIR: Yes.

18                   We can hear you, Robert. Go ahead.

19                   MR. LITTLE: Thank you.

20                   I am Robert Little in Harrisburg,  
21 Pennsylvania. My name is easy, R-O-B-E-R-T,  
22 L-I-T-T-L-E, M.D. I am a retired physician family  
23 doctor here in Harrisburg. And I am also a member  
24 of Physicians for Social Responsibility. And that's  
25 why I'm very interested in this issue we're talking

1 about tonight.

2 Over my 40 years in practice, I have  
3 seen many patients with chronic lung disease, asthma  
4 and heart disease. One of the main contributors to  
5 these diseases is small particle pollution in our  
6 atmosphere. And joining RGGI will help not only  
7 reduce carbon dioxide and methane in the air, of  
8 course, but reduces these small particles, some  
9 people call them soot. These small particles are  
10 what you breathe deep into your lungs, and they stay  
11 there. And they cause much damage. RGGI will do -  
12 do all that for us. And that's why I'm for it.

13 The disease in that we're talking  
14 about here is a cardiovascular disease, also a  
15 leading cause of death in this country. It can be  
16 caused by small particle pollution, too.

17 It's urgent that we join RGGI. RGGI  
18 will reduce pollution. It'll produce \$6 billion in  
19 health benefits through 2030. They estimate more  
20 than 45,000 fewer asthma attacks and more than 1,000  
21 fewer cases of childhood bronchitis among children.

22 And so these regions that I think, in  
23 addition to the climate change, which I'm very  
24 worried about and we know - there's been a lot - a  
25 lot said about that already tonight. But for my

1 profession, I hope that the next generation of  
2 doctors and nurses will see a lot less lung disease.  
3 We've already cut down smoking quite a bit in my  
4 lifetime. That's the main leading cause of - of  
5 lung disease. But air pollution is the next one.

6 And so that's why I'm in favor of  
7 RGGI. And I hope it produces good results for  
8 Pennsylvania. Thank you.

9 CHAIR: Thank you, Dr. Little.

10 Next we have number 42, Lynn Mather.

11 Do we have Lynn on the line? Do we have Lynn?

12 MS. MATHER: Can you hear me?

13 CHAIR: Yeah, we can hear you.

14 MS. MATHER: Oh, good. Oh, okay.

15 CHAIR: You can begin.

16 MS. MATHER: Yes.

17 Lynn Mather, that's L-Y-N-N,  
18 M-A-T-H-E-R. I'm testifying as a citizen and a  
19 resident of Pennsylvania since 1958. I want to  
20 share some personal stories.

21 In the early '60s, I became convinced  
22 we were headed as a nation and a world for an  
23 environmental crisis. Since then, news and events  
24 have reinforced this conviction. In addition, the  
25 passage of time has shown me that we are slow in

1 acknowledging and preparing for this crisis. Over  
2 the years, I increasingly recognized threats to  
3 life, health and wellbeing due to environmental  
4 degradation, particularly to air and water quality.

5           My concern for air quality emboldened  
6 me to address smokers at bus stops and train  
7 stations over the years, asking them to move a  
8 distance from the designated waiting area. Everyone  
9 had the same first reaction to my request, they  
10 would stretch their arm, which held the offending  
11 cigarette, as low to the ground as possible and then  
12 most of them moved a distance away.

13           But I remember this unique response  
14 from one person. This is a free country. After  
15 that, I took care to communicate that they likely  
16 did not realize the experience a non-smoker like  
17 myself might have in the presence of tobacco smoke.  
18 So I crafted my message to be diplomatic, but also  
19 clear and truthful. I realize that people, myself  
20 included, are largely not aware of the effects that  
21 they have on others. So I told them of my  
22 sensitivity to the smoke and my concern for my  
23 health.

24           I sometimes shared my observation that  
25 smokers often seemed unaware of the drifting nature

1 of smoke, how its trajectory widens as the cigarette  
2 is held closer to the ground. But perhaps this  
3 wasn't the best moment for a physics lesson in air  
4 movement.

5                   Air and the movement of air do not  
6 respect geographical borders, whether between  
7 transit riders or between states. The air over New  
8 York State doesn't just stay over in New York. I am  
9 thankful that New York is participating in the  
10 effort to reduce carbon emissions via the RGGI.  
11 Likewise, thankful that New Jersey to our east and  
12 Delaware and Maryland to our south, and Virginia  
13 participate also. And all six states of New  
14 England. I feel especially good about that, since  
15 my roots are in New England.

16                   I would like to regard my state as a  
17 good neighbor as good as these others. We have a  
18 blueprint with the RGGI. It exists already, a  
19 program created, running and producing good results.  
20 And when we join, other neighbors to the west and  
21 further south, I bet they'll get aboard, too.

22                   There are always growing pains. It  
23 wasn't long ago that there were few, if any,  
24 restrictions on freedom to affect the air. In  
25 simplistic terms, we are witnessing a battle between

1 freedoms, the freedom to pollute and the freedom to  
2 breathe. We need to protect our air, the air we  
3 affect and it affects us, the air we share, the air  
4 of our closest neighbors. We're needed in a team  
5 effort. As the heaviest air polluter in the region,  
6 our participation is fundamental.

7                   I am the grandmother of a little girl,  
8 age five. She resides in Brooklyn. A year ago  
9 during a visit with me, her sister came rushing  
10 saying Alana can't breathe. I thought it was  
11 imaginary. It wasn't. Later that night she was  
12 brought to the local hospital's ER. This was the  
13 first among other episodes.

14                   She now has at the ready a medication  
15 for asthma. The cause is not understood. But I  
16 wondered if it might have been residual combustion  
17 products from the fireplace that was a few feet from  
18 where she was struggling to breathe. As troubling  
19 as these experiences have been for my granddaughter  
20 and her family, I know there are many children and  
21 families who have suffered so much more from  
22 polluted air, including respiratory disease, who  
23 have resided near to air polluting plants.

24                   In closing, a question. What is more  
25 important than clean air to humanity and all life on

1 earth? Thank you for listening.

2 CHAIR: Thank you, Lynn.

3 Next, we have number 43, Edward Red.  
4 Do we have Edward on the line?

5 MR. JAGIELA: I do not see Edward on  
6 the line.

7 CHAIR: Okay.

8 Then we will go to number 44. Sandra  
9 Prytherch.

10 MS. PRYTHERCH: Yes. I'm here.

11 CHAIR: Hi, Sandra.

12 MS. PRYTHERCH: Hello.

13 My name is Sandra Postupack Prytherch,  
14 S-A-N-D-R-A, P-O-S-T-U-P-A-C-K,  
15 P-R-Y-T-H-E-R-C-H. I am testifying as a private  
16 citizen.

17 I presently live in Carbon County. I  
18 grew up in West Penn Township, Schuylkill County. I  
19 have also lived in Elizabethtown, Pottsville,  
20 Chambersburg and York. As I've carefully considered  
21 the signs of climate change, I am mindful of the  
22 economic and social challenges of these regions. I  
23 am testifying in support of Pennsylvania proceeding  
24 urgently with RGGI, with a focus on environmental  
25 justice and total reinvestment in clean energy and



1 related initiatives.

2 Funds should not go into the general  
3 fund, but return to clean energy innovation for job  
4 creation and community rebuilding. Others more  
5 qualified than I have eloquently spoken to science  
6 and economics of the matter. I want speak to you  
7 about the very old fashioned idea of stewardship.  
8 By definition this means to take care of something.  
9 And in this case, it is the planet that we call  
10 home.

11 People my age are not likely to suffer  
12 if we don't take care of it. But our children and  
13 grandchildren will. That is why I want you to pay  
14 careful attention. Stewardship is caring enough to  
15 preserve something for those we love, but also for  
16 those we don't even know and may never see. So what  
17 I'm asking you is easy. Let the expert testimony  
18 speak to your heart as well as to your mind.

19 Knowledgeable people are providing  
20 wise counsel about how to address the problem of  
21 greenhouse gases and also address the related  
22 concerns. This helps you be good stewards. I want  
23 you to be courageous here, with conviction, act in  
24 faith to preserve our planet. Finally, I want to  
25 answer - I want to address the answer I have

1 received numerous times from people unwilling to  
2 consider climate change as real.

3 I have heard God is in control so many  
4 times. This generally means that we don't want to  
5 change our minds or our actions. So I ask that you  
6 remember that we are God's hands and feet in the  
7 world. Thus, we are compelled to act. It is our  
8 civic, moral, ethical and spiritual responsibility  
9 to future generations. Thank you for considering my  
10 testimony.

11 CHAIR: Thank you, Sandra. Next, we  
12 have number 46, Kelly Gallo. Hi, Kelly. Are you  
13 on?

14 MS. GALLO: I am.

15 CHAIR: Okay. I'll start your timer.

16 MS. GALLO: Good evening. My name is  
17 Kelly Gallo, K-E-L-L-Y, G-A-L-L-O. And as the  
18 executive director for the Broadhead Watershed  
19 Association, I represent a watershed organization  
20 with a 30-year history of protecting the Broadhead  
21 Creek and its many tributaries. Our dedicated  
22 members watch over 563 miles of streams, most of  
23 which are high quality and exception value streams.  
24 It's because of a desire to protect this priceless  
25 resource in the Poconos that I speak before you

1 tonight.

2                   Due to greenhouse gas emissions from  
3 fossil fuels, such as oil, coal and gas, the climate  
4 is changing across the globe, changing here in  
5 Pennsylvania, here in Monroe County. Climate change  
6 is water change. This water is vital to our lives  
7 and livelihood.

8                   Pennsylvania's energy sector is  
9 responsible for one percent of the world's  
10 emissions. Therefore, it is vital that Pennsylvania  
11 becomes part of the solution to protect our water,  
12 to protect our lives, to protect our livelihoods.  
13 The Pocono region has been experiencing the effects  
14 of these greenhouse gas emissions the past two  
15 decades.

16                   Storms are more frequent and more  
17 intense. While our storm water BMPs and  
18 infrastructure are compliant, they're no longer able  
19 to function as originally intended. Heavy, fast  
20 rainfall from these storms can cause flash flooding  
21 in our head water tributaries, putting lives at risk  
22 and negatively impacting the cold water fisheries  
23 that our local economy depends upon. These  
24 downpours also increase runoff that picks up harmful  
25 pollutants and further impacts these fisheries, as

1 well as their drinking water.

2                   Water runs off so quickly, it does not  
3 allow for infiltration to recharge aquifers that  
4 recharge the streams throughout the year. On the  
5 other side of the climate extremes that we're  
6 experiencing, we've had low amounts of precipitation  
7 throughout the summers and our streams run below  
8 their historic levels at times.

9                   To further compound this problem, our  
10 air temperatures are rising. Temperatures in  
11 Pennsylvania are projected to increase by 5.4  
12 degrees by 2050. And the number of days with a heat  
13 index of above 90 degrees will increase dramatically  
14 from just 8 to 40 per year.

15                   As we experienced this year, this  
16 means higher water temperatures, and therefore,  
17 dangerously low dissolved oxygen levels for the wild  
18 trout the visitors come here for. These warming  
19 water temperatures may also compromise spawning and  
20 embryo survival, further impacting our native brook  
21 trout populations.

22                   The Pocono economy is heavily  
23 dependent on tourism. And another casualty of  
24 climate change is our ski industry. For the ski  
25 industry to remain economically sustainable, the

1 season must be at least 100 days. And having snow  
2 during the holiday time period is vital to  
3 profitability. Our changing climate continues to  
4 shorten our ski season and bring about precipitation  
5 in the form of snow, later in the season.

6           The increased need for snowmaking  
7 operations cuts into profits, further hurting the  
8 industry. And if our resorts become economically  
9 unviable and close, the loss of the resort generated  
10 revenue would be a huge hit to our community and the  
11 many people who depend upon this industry for their  
12 livelihoods. As seen in many other areas of  
13 Pennsylvania, our region has also been heavily  
14 impacted by flooding in the last several years.

15           PennDOT spent more than \$125 million  
16 in 2018 alone to repair public infrastructure due to  
17 flood and landslide damage around the state. Any  
18 way you look at these effects from climate change,  
19 the costs are high, costs to our health, our  
20 environment, our economy, are burdens shouldered by  
21 the taxpayers and citizens of Pennsylvania now and  
22 well into the future.

23           Pennsylvania's involvement in RGGI  
24 will help to ensure that private industry pays for  
25 their environmental degradation, instead of passing

1 the costs on to us. RGGI has been successful in the  
2 ten states where it's already in place, cutting  
3 climate pollution by a third and raising nearly \$3  
4 billion to invest in clean energy projects.

5 Climate change is water change. And  
6 it's time for Pennsylvania to tap into RGGI's record  
7 of success and reduce its carbon pollution. Thank  
8 you.

9 CHAIR: Thank you, Kelly.

10 Next, we have number 47, Kevin Warren.

11 MR. WARREN: Yes, hi. Can you hear  
12 me?

13 CHAIR: Yes.

14 Hi, Kevin. Go ahead.

15 MR. WARREN: Hi. Thanks.

16 Kevin Warren, K-E-V-I-N, W-A-R-R-E-N.

17 I'm from Elk Township in Chester County and I  
18 represent the Elk Creeks Watershed Association,  
19 which coincidentally is another watershed  
20 association.

21 I'd like to thank the DEP and the  
22 Environmental Quality Board for the opportunity to  
23 speak today. As I said, I'm representing the Elk  
24 Creek Watershed Association where I'm on the Board.

25 We're 1 of over 175 watershed

1 associations in Pennsylvania. And all of us on this  
2 call are sitting or standing in a watershed right  
3 now. Ours is located in southern Chester County.  
4 We're in the Chesapeake Bay watershed. But unlike  
5 most others, the Elk Creeks flow directly into the  
6 bay and no first into the Susquehanna. Our creeks  
7 flow through horse farms, Amish and English crop  
8 farms, as well as through thousands of mushroom  
9 farms and an area of intense residential  
10 development.

11 We strongly support joining RGGI for  
12 basically all of the reasons that the prior person  
13 just gave. And I think as a result to save  
14 everybody's time, I'd submit the rest of this in  
15 written comment.

16 CHAIR: Okay. Thanks, Kevin.

17 And thanks for hanging with us. We're  
18 winding down. Next up we have number 48, Laura  
19 Obenski (phonetic).

20 MR. JAGIELA: I do not see Laura on  
21 the line.

22 CHAIR: Okay.

23 And how about 49, Heidi Munn?

24 MS. MUNN: Hello.

25 Can you hear me?

1           CHAIR:  Yep.

2           We can hear you, Heidi.

3           MS. MUNN:  Hi.

4           That's me.  I'm Heidi Munn from just  
5 west of Pittsburgh, H-E-I-D-I, M-U-N-N.  I'm a  
6 hiker, a camper, an artist and a private citizen.  
7 And I strongly support PA joining RGGI.

8           When I heard about this meeting, I  
9 wanted to attend because I've been wondering for  
10 decades, why does my air smell so foul?  My air  
11 smells bad a lot of the time.  In fact, about a year  
12 ago, I walked out my front door and was met with a  
13 blast of horrific chemical smelling air.  And on top  
14 of that, my eyes started to burn.  That's not okay.

15           We've had decades to clean up our air  
16 quality problems and yet our air is still really  
17 bad.  Why is this?  And I'll just submit what  
18 everybody else has been saying about statistics and  
19 where we stand.  Also within the U.S., Pittsburgh  
20 and Philadelphia rank in the top 20 cities of having  
21 overall poor air quality, Pittsburgh generally being  
22 worse.  And many of our counties get Ds or Fs on  
23 their air quality report cards.

24           I'll also point out that according to  
25 a 2019 report by the Institute for Women's Policy



1 Research, Pittsburgh and Philadelphia are not good  
2 places for black and brown women to live. One of  
3 the key categories was health outcomes, where  
4 Philadelphia was below the median and Pittsburgh was  
5 on the very bottom of the list of those 42 cities.

6 I'm bringing it up, because the EPA  
7 has reported for decades that black Americans face  
8 higher health risks from air pollution than other  
9 populations. So it appears to me that Pennsylvania  
10 is really one of the bad guys with our poor air  
11 quality. And shouldn't we be embarrassed as  
12 Pennsylvanians, or even horrified by this?

13 Isn't breathing clean air one of our  
14 basic human rights? I don't know about you, but I  
15 don't want to be one of the bad guys. I believe  
16 it's our duty to fix this problem now for ourselves  
17 and future generations. Besides, in Pennsylvania,  
18 we are winners and we've proved it over and over  
19 again. Pennsylvania has many diverse firsts, so we  
20 all know we have the power to do amazing things.

21 We had the first successful oil well,  
22 the first commercial nuclear generator, the first  
23 hospital, the first art institute, the first stock  
24 exchange and even the first hunting club. And  
25 Pittsburgh is home to many lead certified green

1 building firsts. So if PA has had the first  
2 successful oil well, shouldn't we be on the  
3 forefront of mitigating the problems it causes?  
4 What if PA became the first state whose economy was  
5 once dominated by fossil fuels to join RGGI? What  
6 if we became the first major energy exporter to join  
7 RGGI?

8 PA's current laws give the DEP the  
9 power to regulate carbon pollution and distribute  
10 investments through the Clean Air Fund. We can use  
11 these policies to set your proposed declining carbon  
12 cap and invest allowance money directly into  
13 renewable energy and clean job creation, especially  
14 in our worst pollution hit vulnerable cities. What  
15 if PA became an award winning example of how to  
16 clean up the air? Why not stun everybody?

17 And what if PA's cities became the  
18 best places for black and brown people to live,  
19 rather than being at the very bottom of the list?  
20 If we can be big winner in our sports arenas, why  
21 can't we be big winners in air quality and  
22 environmental justice arenas?

23 When I worked at Bayer before I  
24 retired, our German leaders sent a delegation of  
25 teenagers to Pittsburgh whose great grandparents

1 were Nazis. These teens were eager to engage us in  
2 conversations about the terrible things their  
3 ancestors had done, the shame they felt and their  
4 desire for a better world. I hope our great  
5 grandchildren will not be put in the position to  
6 explain how Pennsylvania dropped the ball in  
7 cleaning up our air and how we especially failed our  
8 black and brown communities.

9                   Instead, let's be world class  
10 champions, like we already know how to be, showing  
11 the world how to innovate and collaborate. And  
12 let's win gold star ratings for our outstanding work  
13 in environmental stewardship and justice. Thank you  
14 for your time.

15                   CHAIR: Thank you, Heidi.

16                   All right. Thank you all for your  
17 patience in hanging in there with us tonight. I  
18 know it was a long - a long hearing. With no other  
19 commenters present, on behalf of the EQB, I hereby  
20 adjourn this hearing at 8:37 p.m.

21

22

\* \* \* \* \*

23

HEARING CONCLUDED AT 8:37 P.M.

24

\* \* \* \* \*

25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify that the foregoing proceeding was reported by me on 12/09/2020 and that I, Kelly Gallick, read this transcript, and that I attest that this transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceeding. This notarial act involved the use of communication technology.

Dated the 12<sup>th</sup> day of January, 2021

  
Kelly Gallick,

Court Reporter